## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS

	)	
CHRISTINA MOYER, et al., individually and	)	
on behalf of a class,	)	
	)	Case No. 14-CV-00561
Plaintiffs.	)	
	)	ECF
V.	)	
	)	Judge Elaine Bucklo
MICHAELS STORES, INC.,	)	C
	)	
Defendant.	)	
	)	

# <u>DEFENDANT MICHAELS STORES, INC.'S MOTION FOR LEAVE</u> TO FILE *INSTANTER* BRIEF IN EXCESS OF PAGE LIMITS

Pursuant to Local Rule 7.1, Defendant Michaels Stores Inc. ("Michaels"), by and through its attorneys, hereby respectfully moves this Court for leave to file *instanter* the attached Memorandum of Law in Support of its Motion to Dismiss Consolidated Class Action Complaint (attached hereto as Exhibit A), which exceeds the fifteen page limit by seven pages. In support of this motion, Michaels states as follows:

- 1. In moving to dismiss Plaintiffs' Consolidated Class Action Complaint, Michaels must address complicated arguments and issues unique to each of the six Plaintiffs.
- 2. Due to the highly speculative nature of Plaintiffs' claims of injury, it is necessary for Michaels to address not only Plaintiffs' failure to state cognizable claims under both Illinois and New York law, but also Plaintiffs' lack of standing to bring such claims.
- 3. Michaels is unable to adequately brief both the Article III standing issues as well as the deficiencies in the claims of the six consolidated Plaintiffs within the fifteen page limit under Local Rule 7.1.

Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 2 of 108 PageID #:301

4. Michaels seeks a modest extension of seven pages so that the Motion to Dismiss will be adequately briefed to fully address the fatal pleading and Article III deficiencies in Plaintiffs' Consolidated Class Action Complaint.

WHEREFORE, Defendant Michaels respectfully moves this Court for leave to file *instanter* the attached Memorandum of Law in Support of its Motion to Dismiss Consolidated Class Action Complaint.

Dated: May 28, 2014

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Theodore R. Scarborough

Scott Lassar Theodore R. Scarborough SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP One South Dearborn Street Chicago, IL 60603 Ph: (312) 853-7000 Fax: (312) 853-7036

slassar@sidley.com tscarborough@sidley.com

Edward Robert McNicholas (admitted *pro hac vice*) SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP 1501 K Street, NW Washington, DC 20005 Ph: (202) 736-8010

Ph: (202) 736-8010 emcnicholas@sidley.com

Attorneys for Michaels Stores, Inc.

OF COUNSEL: Michelle Hartmann SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP 2001 Ross Avenue, Suite 3600 Dallas, Texas 75201

Ph: (214) 981-3300 Fax: (214) 981-3400 mhartmann@sidley.com

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this day, May 28, 2014, I electronically filed the above Michaels Stores, Inc.'s Motion to File *Instanter* Brief In Excess of Page Limits with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will automatically send email notification of such filing to all attorneys of record.

/s/ Theodore R. Scarborough
Theodore R. Scarborough

Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 4 of 108 PageID #:303

## EXHIBIT A

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS

CHRISTINA MOYER, et al., individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,  Plaintiffs.	) ) ) Case Nos. 14-CV-00561; 14-CV-00648; 14) ) CV-1229; 14-CV-1827 (consolidated)		
v.	) ) ECF		
MICHAELS STORES, INC.,	) Judge Elaine Bucklo		
Defendant.	) ) )		

DEFENDANT MICHAELS STORES, INC.'S MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF ITS MOTION TO DISMISS CONSOLIDATED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

1.	PKE	RELIVINARY STATEMENT			
II.	STATEMENT OF FACTS				
III.	ARGUMENT AND AUTHORITIES				
	A.	ndard of Review5			
	В.	Dismissal Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(1) Is Proper Because Plaintiffs Lack Standing Under Article III. 6			
		1.	Plaintiffs' Allegations of Future and Peripheral Injury Are Similar to Those Rejected by the Supreme Court in Clapper		
		2.	Plaintiffs' Allegations of Future and Peripheral Injury Are Identical to Those Rejected by this Court in Barnes & Noble and Strautins9		
		3.	Plaintiffs' Allegations of Future and Peripheral Injury Cannot Be Fairly Traced to Action by Michaels		
	C.		ne Alternative, The Complaint Fails to State a Claim Upon Which Relief  Be Granted		
		1.	Plaintiffs Fail to State a Claim for Breach of Implied Contract		
		2.	Plaintiffs Fail to State a Claim for Violation of the Illinois Consumer Fraud Act, New York General Business Law § 349, and Other Purportedly Similar State Statutes		
IV.	CON	ICLUS	SION		

### TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s) <u>Cases</u>
Adams v. City of Indianapolis, 742 F.3d 720 (7th Cir. 2014)2
Allison v. Aetna, Inc., Civ. A. No. 09-2560, 2010 WL 3719243 (E.D. Pa. Mar. 9, 2010)11
Amburgy v. Express Scripts, Inc., 671 F. Supp. 2d 1046 (E.D. Mo. 2009)
Apex Digital, Inc. v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 572 F.3d 440 (7th Cir. 2009)5
Ashcroft v. Iqbal, 556 U.S. 662 (2009)6, 16
In re Barnes & Noble Pin Pad Litig., No. 12-cv-8617, 2013 WL 4759588 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 3, 2013)
Bell Atl. Corp. v. Twombly, 550 U.S. 544 (2007)
Blackout Sealcoating, Inc. v. Peterson, 894 F. Supp. 2d 1067 (N.D. Ill. 2012)8
Ciszewski v. Denny's Corp., No. 09 C 5355, 2010 WL 1418582 (N.D. Ill. Apr. 7, 2010)19
Clapper v. Amnesty Int'l USA, 133 S. Ct. 1138 (2013) passim
Cooney v. Chi. Pub. Sch., 943 N.E.2d 23 (Ill. App. Ct. 2010)
De Bouse v. Bayer AG, 922 N.E.2d 309 (Ill. 2009),19
Dwyer v. Am. Express Co., 273 Ill. App. 3d 743 (Ill. App. Ct. 1995)14
Forbes v. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A., 420 F. Supp. 2d 1018 (D. Minn. 2006)16
Fleisher v. Phoenix Life Ins. Co., 858 F. Supp. 2d 290 (S.D.N.Y. 2012),20

528 U.S. 167 (2000)	6
Galaria v. Nationwide Mut. Ins. Co., F. Supp. 2d, 2014 WL 689703 (S.D. Ohio Feb. 10, 2014),	13
Hammond v. Bank of N. Y. Mellon Corp., No. 08 Civ. 6060, 2010 WL 2643307 (S.D.N.Y. June 25, 2010)	11, 15, 16
Hendricks v. DSW Shoe Warehouse, Inc., 444 F. Supp. 2d 775 (W.D. Mich. 2006)	16
In re iPhone Application Litig., No. 11-md-2250, 2011 WL 4403963 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 20, 2011)	14
Kaden v. First Commonwealth Ins. Co., 05 C 2212, 2006 WL 1444886 (N.D. Ill. May 18, 2006)	2
Kathrein v. City of Evanston, 636 F.3d 906 (7th Cir. 2011),	5
Langendorf v. Conseco Senior Health Ins. Co., 590 F. Supp. 2d 1020 (N.D. Ill. 2008)	20
In re LinkedIn User Privacy Litig., 932 F. Supp. 2d 1089 (N.D. Cal. 2013)	14
Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife, 504 U.S. 555 (1992)	15
In re Michaels Stores Pin Pad Litig., 830 F. Supp. 2d 518 (N.D. Ill. 2011)	19, 20
Morris v. Harvey Cycle & Camper, Inc., 911 N.E.2d 1049 (Ill. App. Ct. 2009)	20
Oswego Laborers' Local 214 Pension Fund v. Marine Midland Bank, 85 N.Y.2d 20 (1995)	19
Parks v. Wells Fargo Home Mortgage, Inc., 398 F.3d 937 (7th Cir. 2005)	21
Pisciotta v. Old Nat'l Bancorp, 499 F.3d 629 (7th Cir. 2007)	11, 16, 17
Polanco v. Omnicell, Inc., F. Supp. 2d 2013 WL 6823265 (D.N.J. Dec. 26, 2013)	13

Reilly v. Ceridian Corp., 664 F.3d 38 (3d Cir. 2011)	11, 13
Richardson v. DSW, Inc., 2005 WL 2978755 (N.D. Ill. Nov. 3, 2005)	21
Ruiz v. Gap, Inc., 622 F. Supp. 2d 908 (N.D. Cal. 2009)	16
Shaw v. Hyatt Int'l Corp., 461 F.3d 899 (7th Cir. 2006)	20
Small v. Lorillard Tobacco Co., Inc., 94 N.Y.2d 43 (N.Y. 1999)	21
Spencer v. Kemna, 523 U.S. 1 (1998)	5
Sterk v. Best Buy Stores, L.P., No. 11-cv-1894, 2012 WL 5197901 (N.D. III. Oct. 17, 2012)	14
Strautins v. Trustwave Holdings, Inc., F. Supp. 2d, 2014 WL 960816 (N.D. III. Mar. 12, 2014)	2, 10, 11
Stutman v. Chem. Bank, 95 N.Y.2d 24 (N.Y. 2000)	18, 21
Toney v. Kinsch, No. 10 C 06375, 2012 WL 567729 (N.D. III. Feb. 21, 2012)	18, 21
Typpi v. PNC Bank, N.A., No. 13-CV-3930, 2014 WL 296035 (N.D. Ill. Jan. 27, 2014)	22
Vides v. Advocate Health & Hosp. Corp., Case No. 13-CH-2701 (Ill. Cir. Ct. [Lake County] May 27, 2014)	10, 12
Warth v. Seldin, 422 U.S. 490 (1975)	6
Windy City Metal Fabricators & Supply, Inc. v. CIT Tech. Fin. Servs., Inc., 536 F.3d 663 (7th Cir. 2008)	22
Worix v. MedAssets, Inc., 857 F. Supp. 2d 699 (N.D. Ill. 2012)	20
In re Zappos.com, Inc. Customer Data Sec. Breach Litig., No. 3:12_cv_00325, 2013 WL 4830497 (D. Ney Sept. 9, 2013)	17

### RULES

Fed. R. Civ. P. 9(b)	21
Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1)	5, 6
Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6)	5, 15, 22

#### I. PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

Plaintiffs seek to assert claims arising from the recent cyber security incursion at Michaels Stores, Inc. ("Michaels" or the "Company"). Fatal to their claims, however, is that they do not allege *any* cognizable injury, much less cognizable injury plausibly caused by Michaels.

Starting just two days after Michaels announced that it had learned of possible fraudulent activity on some U.S. payment cards used at Michaels, plaintiff Christina Moyer and the other named plaintiffs in these now-consolidated cases (collectively, "Plaintiffs") began filing class action suits. Michaels has confirmed that it suffered a data security incident, but a data security incident does not, nor should it ever, result automatically in cognizable injury to Plaintiffs. A misunderstanding of that fundamental rule of law is at the heart of Plaintiffs' pleading deficiencies. Noticeably absent from the Complaint is any allegation that Plaintiffs suffered from or paid for any fraudulent charges, that their banks are even attempting to hold them liable for any fraudulent charges, or that they have otherwise expended any funds at all as a result of the data security incident. Indeed, only one of the six Plaintiffs (Ms. Whalen) makes any allegation that credit card information was stolen, but even she does not allege that she suffered fraudulent charges, cryptically alleging instead that her card was merely "presented" for a purchase. And even if Plaintiffs had alleged fraudulent charges (which they do not), Plaintiffs do not (and cannot) allege that any of those charges remained unreimbursed or that their card issuers were holding them liable for any unauthorized charges. Finally, at least three of the Plaintiffs do not even allege that they made purchases at a Michaels store during the period of time in which any data was exposed from that store—a deficiency that completely dooms their claim.

While Plaintiffs devote several pages to generalized stories regarding identity theft, they do not allege any facts suggesting that any Plaintiff has been or will be the victim of identity

theft. Instead, they rely on vague assertions of speculative future injury, which have been consistently rejected as insufficient to create standing or state a claim for which relief can be granted. Without an allegation of specific facts constituting an injury-in-fact that is fairly traceable to the actions of Michaels, recent decisions from the United States Supreme Court and this Court mandate dismissal of the Complaint for lack of standing under Article III. *See Clapper v. Amnesty Int'l USA*, 133 S. Ct. 1138, 1147 (2013); *Strautins v. Trustwave Holdings, Inc.*, -- F. Supp. 2d --, 2014 WL 960816, at \*1 (N.D. Ill. Mar. 12, 2014); *In re Barnes & Noble Pin Pad Litig.*, No. 12-cv-8617, 2013 WL 4759588 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 3, 2013). Even if Plaintiffs could arguably satisfy the requirements to prove Article III standing, Plaintiffs' failure (and inability) to allege *any* injury means that each of their claims for relief must be dismissed under Rule 12(b)(6).

#### II. STATEMENT OF FACTS

Plaintiffs seek damages allegedly arising from a data security incident that was the result of a criminal attack on the Company's computer systems, which exposed payment card account numbers used at certain Michaels stores between May 8, 2013 and January 27, 2014. Michaels has described the data incursion in the website postings cited in the Complaint. (*See* Consolidated Class Action Complaint (the "Complaint") ¶¶ 2-3, 18-20.) As reported there, Michaels first learned in late January 2014 that there was possible fraudulent activity on some U.S. payment cards that had been used at Michaels, suggesting that Michaels had experienced a possible data security attack. (*Id.* at ¶ 2.) Michaels informed its customers of the possibility that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The website information, attached hereto as Exhibits A-C, are cited in the Complaint and referred to extensively therein (*see* Compl. ¶¶ 1-2, 17-20, 42-43), and, therefore, may be reviewed on a motion to dismiss. *Adams v. City of Indianapolis*, 742 F.3d 720, 729 (7th Cir. 2014) ("[D]ocuments attached to a motion to dismiss are considered part of the pleadings if they are referred to in the plaintiff's complaint and are central to his claim."); *Kaden v. First Commonwealth Ins. Co.*, 05 C 2212, 2006 WL 1444886 (N.D. Ill. May 18, 2006) (Bucklo, J.) (same).

it had experienced a data security attack, that it was working with federal law enforcement and third-party data security experts to investigate the facts around the possible attack, and that it would continue to provide updates as the investigation continued.<sup>2</sup>

On April 17, 2014, Michaels provided an update to its customers.<sup>3</sup> Michaels reported that its two independent forensic firms "discovered evidence confirming systems of Michaels stores in the United States . . . were attacked by criminals using highly sophisticated malware that had not been encountered previously by either of the security firms." (April Letter.) The April Letter also includes three key disclosures: First, the only data at risk was payment card number and expiration date; no other personal data, such as name, address, or PIN, was at risk. (*Id.*) Second, the data security incident affected only a limited number of the point-of-sale systems at a limited number of stores. (*Id.*)<sup>5</sup> Third, credit monitoring services are offered to affected Michaels customers for twelve months at no cost. (April Letter.)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A Letter From Our CEO, posted on <a href="http://www.michaels.com/payment-card-notice-ceo-120514/payment-card-notice-CEO-12514.html">http://www.michaels.com/payment-card-notice-ceo-120514/payment-card-notice-CEO-12514.html</a> (Jan. 25, 2014) (the "January Letter"), a true and correct copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> *Updated Letter From Our CEO*, posted on <a href="http://www.michaels.com/payment-card-notice-ceo-letter/payment-card-notice-CEO.html">http://www.michaels.com/payment-card-notice-ceo-letter/payment-card-notice-CEO.html</a> (April 17, 2014) (the "April Letter"), a true and correct copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit B.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Plaintiffs include in the putative class definition absent class members that made an in-store purchase at an Aaron Brothers store. (*See* Compl. ¶46.) However, Aaron Brothers, Inc., which operates the Aaron Brothers stores, is not a named defendant. Other than stating that Aaron Brothers is a subsidiary of Michaels, Plaintiffs make no allegations about Aaron Brothers, much less allegations sufficient to pierce the corporate veil. None of the Plaintiffs allege that they made any purchases at an Aaron Brothers store and, indeed, there are none in Illinois or New York. The attempt to sweep Aaron Brothers customers into the class definition characteristically overreaches and should be stricken.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The April Letter cites to and directs consumers to the list of "locations and potential dates of exposure for each affected Michaels store." (*Id.*) A true and correct copy of the Affected U.S. Michaels Stores and Dates of Exposure (the "Affected Stores List"), which was integral to the April Letter, is attached hereto as Exhibit C and available at <a href="http://demandware.edgesuite.net/aaeo\_prd/on/demandware.static/Sites-MichaelsUS-Site/Sites-MichaelsUS-Library/default/v1399612220092/docs/corporate/US-Michaels-Stores-List-4-17-14.pdf.</a>

Plaintiffs allege that they visited various Michaels stores in Illinois and New York and made purchases on their credit or debit cards from November 2013 through January 2014.

(Compl. ¶¶ 11-15.) Three of the six Plaintiffs fail to allege *any* purchase during a time when the store from which they made a purchase was affected by the data security incident. No Plaintiff actually alleges that fraudulent charges were incurred on his or her card, and only one Plaintiff, Ms. Whalen, alleges that someone *attempted* to use her credit card (but does not allege that the charge was approved). (*See id.*) None of the Plaintiffs, including Ms. Whalen, allege that they actually paid for fraudulent charges, that their banks are even attempting to hold them liable for any fraudulent charges, or that they have otherwise expended any funds at all as a result of the data security incident. (*See id.*)

Similarly, although Plaintiffs quote from a Government Accountability Office study on identity theft, they do not allege that they have suffered any form of identity theft, nor could they, given that the type of information compromised—payment card numbers—did not include the sort of governmental identifier, such as driver's license number or social security number, which would be required for identity theft. The theft of payment card numbers alone is insufficient as a matter of law to plausibly allege identity theft. Rather, Plaintiffs allege only generalized, speculative, prospective harms, suffered not by them individually, but instead hypothetically suffered by non-specified putative class members generally. For example, Plaintiffs allege that "Class members . . . have had their financial information placed at serious and ongoing risk." (Id. at ¶ 22.) Plaintiffs further allege that they suffered harm from the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The Gouwens made purchases at the Kildeer location on December 5 and 11, 2013, and on January 16, 2014 (Compl. ¶ 12); however, data from the Kildeer location was only at risk of exposure from May 8, 2013 through July 29, 2013. (Affected Stores List at 16.) Similarly, Mr. Ripes made a purchase at the Glenview location on November 3, 2013 and at the Vernon Hills location on December 28, 2013 (Compl. ¶ 14); but data from each of those locations was also only at risk of exposure from May 8, 2013 through July 29, 2013. (Affected Stores List at 16-17.)

"increased risk of identity theft." (*Id.* at ¶ 44.) Ignoring the free credit monitoring and insurance Michaels is offering, they also allege that "consumers," but not Plaintiffs themselves, "must expend considerable time taking these precautions [checking their credit reports, etc.] for years to come," and that they suffered damages "based on the opportunity cost and value of time that [they] have been forced to expend to monitor their financial and bank accounts." (*Id.* at ¶ 42, 45.) Finally, Plaintiffs allege that because a "portion of the services purchased from Michaels ... necessarily included compliance with industry-standard measures with respect to the collection and safeguarding of PII, ... [they] incurred actual monetary damages in that they overpaid for the products purchased from Michaels." (*Id.* at ¶ 40.) None of these allegations are sufficient to confer standing on Plaintiffs or to provide Plaintiffs with the requisite injury to state viable claims for relief.

#### III. ARGUMENT AND AUTHORITIES

#### A. Standard of Review

In deciding a motion to dismiss a claim for lack of standing under Rule 12(b)(1), the "plaintiff bears the burden of showing the jurisdictional requirements, including standing, have been met." *In re Barnes & Noble*, 2013 WL 4759588, at \*3 (citing *Kathrein v. City of Evanston*, 636 F.3d 906, 914 (7th Cir. 2011)). When deciding that motion at the pleadings stage, all "material allegations of the complaint are construed as true, and all reasonable inferences are drawn in favor of the plaintiff." *Id.* (citing *Apex Digital, Inc. v. Sears, Roebuck & Co.*, 572 F.3d 440, 443 (7th Cir. 2009)). However, standing may not "be inferred argumentatively from averments in the pleadings." *Spencer v. Kemna*, 523 U.S. 1, 10-11 (1998) (internal quotation omitted).

If the Court proceeds to analyze the motion to dismiss under Rule 12(b)(6), the Complaint must be dismissed if it does not contain "enough facts to state a claim to relief that is

plausible on its face. *Bell Atl. Corp. v. Twombly*, 550 U.S. 544, 570 (2007). The Court must accept all well-pleaded allegations as true and in a light most favorable to the plaintiff, but mere "labels and conclusions" or "a formulaic recitation of the elements of a cause of action will not do." *Id.* "[O]nly a complaint that states a plausible claim for relief survives a motion to dismiss." *Ashcroft v. Iqbal*, 556 U.S. 662, 679 (2009). "Threadbare recitals of the elements of a cause of action, supported by mere conclusory statements, do not suffice." *Id.* at 678.

# B. Dismissal Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(1) Is Proper Because Plaintiffs Lack Standing Under Article III.

1. Plaintiffs' Allegations of Future and Peripheral Injury Are Similar to Those Rejected by the Supreme Court in Clapper.

The Complaint fails to even come close to adequately alleging that Plaintiffs possess the requisite standing under Article III of the Constitution.

Article III requires that "a plaintiff must show (1) it has suffered an 'injury in fact' that is (a) concrete and particularized and (b) actual or imminent, not conjectural or hypothetical; (2) the injury is fairly traceable to the challenged action of the defendant; and (3) it is likely, as opposed to merely speculative, that the injury will be redressed by a favorable decision."

Friends of the Earth, Inc. v. Laidlaw Envtl. Servs. (TOC), Inc., 528 U.S. 167, 180-181 (2000); see also Clapper, 133 S. Ct. at 1147 ("[W]e have repeatedly reiterated that threatened injury must be certainly impending to constitute injury in fact, and that allegations of possible future injury are not sufficient." (internal citation omitted and emphasis in original)). And in the class action context, it is settled that "Petitioners must allege and show that they personally have been injured, not that injury has been suffered by other, unidentified members of the class to which they belong and which they purport to represent." Warth v. Seldin, 422 U.S. 490, 502 (1975) (emphasis added).

Here, far from alleging specific and personal injury that is "certainly impending," the named Plaintiffs allege only future and hypothetical injury that has been held time and again to be insufficient to confer constitutional standing. *See Clapper*, 133 S. Ct. at 1147 (holding that allegations of possible future injury were not sufficient to confer standing). Five of the six Plaintiffs do not even allege that there have been *any* unauthorized activity on their accounts, and the sixth only alleges that a card bearing her credit card number was "presented for payment." (Compl. ¶¶ 11-15.) Noticeably absent from the Complaint is any allegation that any of the Plaintiffs were actually harmed in that they suffered from *unreimbursed* fraudulent charges. In that regard, Plaintiffs do not allege that they have borne, are bearing, or will have to bear *any financial responsibility* for any alleged fraudulent charges, as any charge, had it been made, would have been reimbursed.

The only statement regarding monetary loss consists of a single conclusory statement, made almost in passing, in Paragraph 41 of the Complaint. In that single paragraph, Plaintiffs make the bald statement that "Plaintiffs and the Class have suffered . . . actual damages including monetary losses arising from unauthorized bank account withdrawals, fraudulent card payments, and/or related bank fees charged to their accounts." (Compl. ¶ 41.) This bare allegation is not supported by any specific facts about any particular monetary losses, and, in fact, is belied by the complete omission of any allegation of bank fee charges made on the named Plaintiffs' accounts and the noticeable absence of any allegation by any of the Plaintiffs that any charge was made, much less that it remained unreimbursed. If any of the Plaintiffs possessed facts—rather than

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> To the extent that any assertions could be construed as alleging monetary loss, such an allegation cannot be given any credence, as the card issuers have zero liability policies for fraudulent charges. *See, e.g.*, Chase Debit Cards Website, <a href="https://www.chase.com/checking/debit-cards">https://www.chase.com/checking/debit-cards</a> ("Chase reimburses you for any unauthorized card transaction made at stores, ATMs, on the phone or online when reported promptly.").

mere conclusions—regarding unauthorized charges or umreimbursed losses, they certainly would have, and would have been required to have, pled them. The omission is revealing, and, of course, this unsubstantiated, contradictory, and conclusory statement found only in this single paragraph cannot salvage the complete lack of particularized injury-in-fact allegations made in the remaining 102-paragraph Complaint. *See, e.g., Blackout Sealcoating, Inc. v. Peterson*, 894 F. Supp. 2d 1067, 1070 (N.D. Ill. 2012) (Bucklo, J.) ("[T]he complaint does not substantiate this conclusory statement with the kind of factual material that would raise their right to relief 'above the speculative level." (quoting *Twombly*, 550 U.S. at 555)).

Shorn of the conclusory allegations bearing no factual support whatsoever, Plaintiffs' alleged harm consists only of future and peripheral injuries. For example, Plaintiffs allege that "consumers must expend considerable time taking these precautions [such as checking credit reports, closing accounts] for years to come." (Compl. ¶ 42).) Similarly, Plaintiffs allege "damages based on the opportunity cost and value of time that Plaintiffs and the Class have been forced to expend to monitor their financial and bank accounts." (*Id.* at ¶ 45.) Plaintiffs also allege that they suffered damages in the form of "costs associated with identity theft and the increased risk of identity theft." (*Id.* at ¶ 44.) Finally, Plaintiffs allege that "they overpaid for the products purchased from Michaels" because a "portion of the services purchased from Michaels by Plaintiffs and the Class necessarily included compliance with industry-standard measures with respect to the collection and safeguarding of PII." (*Id.* at ¶ 40.)

Whether standing can be conferred through allegations of these types of "hypothetical injury," such as allegedly having to take precautions to avoid future harm in future years, was addressed recently by the United States Supreme Court in *Clapper v. Amnesty International USA*. 133 S. Ct. at 1147. In *Clapper*, the plaintiffs (attorneys, journalists, and other

professionals) believed it likely that U.S. intelligence officials were intercepting their confidential communications with foreign citizens. 133 S. Ct. at 1142. To avoid that surveillance, they allegedly took "costly and burdensome measures to protect the confidentiality of their communications," such as "avoid[ing] certain e-mail and phone conversations" and "travel[ing] so that they c[ould] have in-person conversations." *Id.* at 1151. The Court found those alleged costs to be insufficient:

[Plaintiffs'] contention that they have standing because they incurred certain costs as a reasonable reaction to a risk of harm is unavailing—because the harm respondents seek to avoid is not certainly impending. In other words, [Plaintiffs] cannot manufacture standing merely by inflicting harm on themselves based on their fears of hypothetical future harm that is not certainly impending.

*Id.* (emphasis added). There is no difference between the "hypothetical future harms" alleged by the plaintiffs in *Clapper* and those alleged by Plaintiffs in this case. Accordingly, and pursuant to the Supreme Court's guidance in *Clapper*, allegations that Plaintiffs incurred time and expense to mitigate risks of identity theft and that their credit card information is at an increased risk of theft and unauthorized use (Compl. ¶¶ 40-45), are plainly insufficient to confer the requisite Article III standing.

2. Plaintiffs' Allegations of Future and Peripheral Injury Are Identical to Those Rejected by this Court in Barnes & Noble and Strautins.

In the wake of *Clapper*, this Court has dismissed on standing grounds two data breach complaints that are strikingly similar to the Complaint before the Court. Plaintiffs' Complaint includes no distinguishing fact that should warrant a different outcome here.

In the first case, Judge Darrah dismissed a suit seeking damages arising after customer payment card data was stolen from Barnes & Noble. *In re Barnes & Noble*, 2013 WL 4759588. The plaintiffs in that case alleged that they purchased goods from Barnes & Noble while Barnes

& Noble was experiencing a data security breach. *Id.* at \*1-2. Similar to the allegations made by Plaintiffs in the case before the Court, the plaintiffs in *Barnes & Noble* alleged damages comprised of *reimbursed* fraudulent charges, diminished value of products and services, an increased risk of identity theft, time and expenses incurred to mitigate the risks of identity theft, improper disclosure of personal identifying information, and inadequate notification of the security breach. The alleged harm was held to be inadequate to confer constitutional standing: "In order to have suffered an actual injury, [plaintiff] must have had an *unreimbursed* charge on her credit card." *Id.* at \*3-6 (emphasis added).

In the second case, Judge Tharp granted a motion to dismiss where plaintiffs alleged that personal identifying information was stolen from the South Carolina Department of Revenue's tax database. *See Strautins*, 2014 WL 960816, at \*1. The plaintiffs in that case alleged that "hackers gained access to SCDOR data" and thereafter "stole and compromised her PII." *Id.* Citing both *Clapper* and *Barnes & Noble*, this Court found the following allegations to be "too speculative to permit the complaint to go forward": allegations of untimely notification, out-of-pocket expenses and/or time incurred to mitigate the increase risk of identity theft, and the deprivation of the value of the plaintiff's PII. *Id.* at \*3-4.

In reaching their decisions and holding that allegations of future harm or steps taken to mitigate future harm were insufficient to confer standing on the plaintiffs, Judges Tharp and Darrah both relied heavily on the Supreme Court's recent decision in *Clapper*. But even before *Clapper* was decided, a long line of courts recognized that the *possibility* that stolen data could

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> And just yesterday, an Illinois Circuit Court granted a motion to dismiss a putative class action arising out of a data breach, holding that *Clapper* compelled "rejection of Plaintiffs' argument that an increased risk of identity theft is sufficient to satisfy the injury-in-fact requirement for standing." *Vides v. Advocate Health & Hosp. Corp.*, Case No. 13-CH-2701, at \*5 (Ill. Cir. Ct. [Lake County] May 27, 2014) (attached hereto as Exhibit D).

result in financial injury to plaintiffs was "future-oriented, hypothetical, and conjectural," and therefore did not provide for standing. *Hammond v. Bank of N. Y. Mellon Corp.*, No. 08 Civ. 6060, 2010 WL 2643307, at \*7 (S.D.N.Y. June 25, 2010) (no standing where unencrypted data lost by transport company); *see also Reilly v. Ceridian Corp.*, 664 F.3d 38, 43 (3d Cir. 2011) (no standing based on future injury where hacker allegedly stole data); *Amburgy v. Express Scripts, Inc.*, 671 F. Supp. 2d 1046 (E.D. Mo. 2009) (alleged increased risk for identity theft due to hacker accessing information insufficient to show injury); *Allison v. Aetna, Inc.*, Civ. A. No. 09-2560, 2010 WL 3719243 (E.D. Pa. Mar. 9, 2010) ("alleged injury of an increased risk of identity theft is far too speculative" to provide standing). The holdings of these cases have only been strengthened by the Supreme Court's subsequent decision in *Clapper*.

Michaels anticipates that Plaintiffs will cite the Court to *Pisciotta v. Old Nat'l Bancorp*, 499 F.3d 629 (7th Cir. 2007), for the proposition that future identity theft may suffice for standing purposes. Even before *Clapper*, the Seventh Circuit's holding as to standing was widely criticized. *See*, *e.g.*, *Reilly*, 664 F.3d at 44 (recognizing that *Pisciotta* did not mention that a threatened injury must be imminent to confer standing); *Amburgy*, 671 F. Supp. 2d at 1051 (noting that the Seventh Circuit engaged in no discussion applying the standard for determining standing in a data breach case). But more importantly, the *Pisciotta* decision pre-dates the Supreme Court's decision in *Clapper* and simply cannot be reconciled with *Clapper*, at least insofar as the standing analysis is concerned. In *Strautins*, Judge Tharp held that the standing analysis contained in *Pisciotta* was inconsistent with and could not be reconciled with the *Clapper* decision, and in *Barnes & Noble*, Judge Darrah followed *Clapper*, not *Pisciotta*, as the binding precedent. *See Strautins*, 2014 WL 960816, at \*5-6 ("[T]his Court concludes that it is duty bound to apply that standard in this case notwithstanding seemingly inconsistent Seventh

Circuit precedent that predates *Clapper*."); *Barnes & Noble*, 2013 WL 4759588, at \*2; *Vides*, Case No. 13-CH-2701, at \*7 (Ex. D). The Court here should also follow *Clapper* and recognize that *Pisciotta* is no longer controlling authority.

Just as in Clapper, Barnes & Noble, Strautins, and other similar decisions, Plaintiffs' allegations, which consist almost entirely of future harm, fall well below the standard necessary to establish constitutional standing. Here, there is no allegation that any alleged harm that Plaintiffs face is "certainly impending." See Clapper, 133 S. Ct. at 1147. Nor can there be any reasonable inference that there is some impending harm, as the Complaint alleges no facts that would allow this Court to believe that Plaintiffs are at any risk of future identity theft. Even when payment card numbers are exposed, credit and debit card account numbers are obviously not the sort of government-issued identification, such as Social Security numbers or driver's licenses, that could theoretically be used to impersonate an individual and open a new account in her name. Plaintiffs do not allege that names, Social Security numbers, dates of birth, or other information needed to open new accounts were compromised. The prospect of identity theft resulting solely from having a payment card number exposed is highly implausible. This is precisely the kind of speculative, distant, uncertain injury that the Supreme Court rejected in Clapper. Moreover, Plaintiffs also do not allege that their credit card accounts remain active and capable of incurring additional charges, and thus cannot show the requisite injury for Article III standing. Finally, even if they were to incur fraudulent charges, Plaintiffs do not allege that they would be held liable for paying those fraudulent charges. In short, there is nothing imminent or plausible about the Plaintiffs' alleged harms.

Costs taken to mitigate these speculative injuries are also insufficient to provide Plaintiffs with Article III standing. Where there is only a potential future harm, actions taken now in an

attempt to mitigate that future harm are insufficient to create standing. See Clapper, 133 S. Ct. at 1151 (plaintiffs "cannot manufacture standing merely by inflicting harm on themselves based on their fears of a hypothetical future harm that is not certainly impending"). Earlier this year, a district court in a case involving a data breach at Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company reached the same conclusion, holding that "an increased risk of identity theft, identity fraud, medical fraud or phishing is not itself an injury-in-fact because Named Plaintiffs did not allege or offer facts to make plausible—an allegation that such harm is 'certainly impending.'" Galaria v. Nationwide Mut. Ins. Co., -- F. Supp. 2d --, 2014 WL 689703, at \*5 (S.D. Ohio Feb. 10, 2014) (holding that where computer system was hacked and consumers' personal information was stolen and disseminated, allegations of increased risk of harm, loss of privacy, and deprivation of the value of the personal information were insufficient to show standing). Here, entirely neglecting that Michaels is offering free credit monitoring and identity theft insurance, Plaintiffs allege the same self-inflicted injuries raised in Barnes & Noble—time and expenses incurred to mitigate the risk of future injury. See Barnes & Noble, 2013 WL 4759588, at \*4. Because the harms Plaintiffs allegedly sought to mitigate are not "certainly impending," the time and expenses incurred are wholly irrelevant to the question of standing. See id.

And Plaintiffs' allegation of peripheral injury—that they allegedly "incurred actual monetary damages in that they overpaid for the products purchased from Michaels" because the price of the goods included safeguarding their credit card information, (id. at ¶ 40)—has been

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> See also Reilly, 664 F.3d at 46 ("costs incurred to watch for a speculative chain of future events based on hypothetical future criminal acts are no more 'actual' injuries that the alleged 'increased risk of injury'"); *Polanco v. Omnicell, Inc.*, -- F. Supp. 2d --, 2013 WL 6823265 (D.N.J. Dec. 26, 2013) (seeking treatment at a different hospital is not sufficient to establish standing because decision was based entirely on speculative belief that previous hospital would lose personal information again); *Amburgy*, 671 F. Supp. 2d at 1053 (plaintiff lacked standing even though he had already expended funds to mitigate potential future damages).

raised and rejected by this Court as speculative. As in Barnes & Noble, there is no allegation here that Michaels "charged a higher price for goods whether a customer pays with credit [versus paying with cash," or that customers could therefore expect additional value (i.e., data security) when paying by credit card. See Barnes & Noble, 2013 WL 4759588, at \*5. Other courts have come to the same conclusion when faced with similar allegations of peripheral injury. See, e.g., In re LinkedIn User Privacy Litig., 932 F. Supp. 2d 1089, 1093 (N.D. Cal. 2013) (premium users were not paying for additional privacy where the privacy policy for LinkedIn users was the same regardless of whether a person paid for premium services or utilized the free version); Sterk v. Best Buy Stores, L.P., No. 11-cv-1894, 2012 WL 5197901, at \*7 (N.D. Ill. Oct. 17, 2012) (dismissing claim based on lack of standing where plaintiff alleged he overpaid because Best Buy was not complying with credit card laws, but there was no difference in price for credit or cash purposes); In re iPhone Application Litig., No. 11-md-2250, 2011 WL 4403963, at \*4-6 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 20, 2011) (holding that undifferentiated "lost opportunity costs" and "value-forvalue exchanges" resulting from collection and tracking of personal information were not cognizable injuries in fact); Dwyer v. Am. Express Co., 273 Ill. App. 3d 743, 749 (Ill. App. Ct. 1995) (suggesting that any value is created by defendants who "categoriz[e] and aggregat[e]" personal information). This Court should follow these well-reasoned decisions, including from this Court, and likewise hold that allegations of the lesser value of goods are insufficient to establish standing.

In sum, Plaintiffs fail to allege what damage—what concrete and compensable harm—is being suffered *here and now*. Plaintiffs have not paid *any* cash out of pocket; Plaintiffs do not allege that their banks have asked them to pay any alleged fraudulent charges; and Plaintiffs do not allege any other presently realized (or "certainly impending") harm in the Complaint. As

such, Plaintiffs have failed to plead the "irreducible constitutional minimum" of federal standing, and the case must be dismissed. *Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife*, 504 U.S. 555, 560 (1992).

3. Plaintiffs' Allegations of Future and Peripheral Injury Cannot Be Fairly Traced to Action by Michaels.

Even if the injuries allegedly suffered by Plaintiffs were sufficient to establish standing, Plaintiffs cannot demonstrate that the alleged injuries are fairly traceable to action taken by Michaels. See, e.g., Clapper, 133 S. Ct. at 1147. Importantly, Plaintiffs have not pled that their alleged injuries were directly or indirectly caused by actions taken by Michaels. In fact, three of the six Plaintiffs fail to allege a purchase during a time when the store from which they made a purchase was affected. (Compare Compl. ¶¶ 12, 14 with Affected Stores List at 15-17.) Because Mr. Gouwens, Ms. Gouwens, and Mr. Ripes cannot state a claim for harm based on any action taken by Michaels—there is no allegation that the security incident was active in those stores at the time of their purchases—their claims must be dismissed. And for the other three Plaintiffs, there are and could be only allegations of a "mere coincidence in timing," which are insufficient to establish a causal connection between the alleged breach. See Hammond, 2010 WL 2643307, at \*5, 13. Finally, Plaintiffs have not pled that any alleged harm has resulted because of actions taken by Michaels, as opposed to some other manner through which their credit card information could have been stolen. For all these reasons, Plaintiffs have failed to allege standing, and the Complaint should be dismissed.

# C. In the Alternative, The Complaint Fails to State a Claim Upon Which Relief May Be Granted.

Even if Plaintiffs were able to establish standing, the Complaint still should be dismissed for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted. Under Rule 12(b)(6) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, a motion to dismiss should be granted if the complaint does not contain "enough facts to state a claim to relief that is plausible on its face." *Twombly*, 550 U.S. at 570.

"A complaint must contain enough 'factual content' to allow a court 'to draw the reasonable inference that the defendant is liable for the misconduct alleged." *Iqbal*, 556 U.S. at 678. A complaint that offers only "labels and conclusions" or "a formulaic recitation of the elements of a cause of action will not do." *Twombly*, 550 U.S. at 555. Moreover, courts "are not bound to accept as true a legal conclusion couched as a factual allegation." *Id.* "Nor does a complaint suffice if it tenders 'naked assertion[s]' devoid of 'further factual enhancement." *Iqbal*, 556 U.S. at 678. In other words, Plaintiffs' factual allegations must be sufficient "to raise a right to relief above the speculative level." *See Twombly*, 550 U.S. at 555. When viewed through these standards, Plaintiffs' claims cannot proceed.

1. Plaintiffs Fail to State a Claim for Breach of Implied Contract.

Plaintiffs allege that Michaels breached an implied contract to protect customer data. (See Compl. ¶ 63.) As held by the Seventh Circuit, such a claim for breach of implied contract turns on and necessarily requires Plaintiffs to plead actual monetary harm that has resulted from the alleged breach of contract. See Pisciotta, 499 F.3d at 632 (holding, in the portion of decision not addressed by Clapper, breach of contract claim fails where plaintiff did not "allege any completed direct financial loss to their accounts as a result of the breach"). Plaintiffs here do not allege that they have suffered any financial loss from unreimbursed charges or that they have been a victim of identity theft. Accordingly, they fail to state a contract claim for which relief can be granted.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Numerous other courts have dismissed contract claims in data security cases holding that there was no allegation of injury. *See*, *e.g.*, *Hammond*, 2010 WL 2643307, at \*11; *Hendricks v. DSW Shoe Warehouse*, *Inc.*, 444 F. Supp. 2d 775, 780 (W.D. Mich. 2006) (granting 12(b)(6) motion and dismissing contract claims for failure to demonstrate injury where plaintiff alleged damages for purchasing credit monitoring and unauthorized access to her PII); *Forbes v. Wells Fargo Bank*, *N.A.*, 420 F. Supp. 2d 1018, 2021 (D. Minn. 2006) (dismissing breach of contract claim based on lack of injury); *Ruiz v. Gap*, *Inc.*, 622 F. Supp. 2d 908, 917 (N.D. Cal. 2009) (dismissing breach of contract claim where plaintiff was not a victim of identity theft and could not show damages by pointing to fear of future identity theft).

Plaintiffs' failure to provide any explanation of how the sale of merchandise by Michaels using credit cards implies any agreement between Plaintiffs and Michaels regarding "reasonable measures to safeguard their financial data" is similarly fatal to their claims. (Compl. ¶ 63.) Indeed, in discussing breach of implied contract claims in the data privacy realm, the Seventh Circuit remarked that "Plaintiffs have not come forward with a single case or statute, from any jurisdiction, authorizing the kind of action they now ask this federal court to recognize as a valid theory of recovery," and declined to such a "substantive innovation." *Pisciotta*, 499 F.3d at 639-40. The MDL court in *In re Zappos.com*, *Inc. Customer Data Security Breach Litigation* likewise declined to recognize a new claim for breach of implied contract in similar circumstances:

But there is no allegation of any express or implied contract. The only allegations alleged to give rise to any contract are that customers agreed to pay money for goods, and that statements on Zappos's website indicated that its servers were protected by a secure firewall and that customers' data was safe. The first type of contract for the sale of goods is not alleged to have been breached, and the *unilateral statements of fact alleged as to the safety of customers' data do not create any contractual obligations*.

*In re Zappos.com*, No. 3:12–cv–00325, 2013 WL 4830497, at \*3 (D. Nev. Sept. 9, 2013) (emphasis added).

Similarly, Plaintiffs here have not alleged any contractual obligations other than a sale of goods that was "not alleged to have been breached." *See id.* There is no allegation that the parties agreed on any other terms related to the protection of the consumer's information, and the breach of implied contract claim should be dismissed on this basis as well.

2. Plaintiffs Fail to State a Claim for Violation of the Illinois Consumer Fraud Act, New York General Business Law § 349, and Other Purportedly Similar State Statutes. 11

Plaintiffs allege that Michaels "violated 815 ILCS 505/2 [and N.Y. Gen. Bus. Law § 349] by failing to properly implement adequate, commercially reasonable security measures to protect Plaintiffs' and other members' private financial information." (Compl. ¶¶ 73, 100.) The allegations fail to state a valid claim under these state laws.

"Plaintiffs must prove five elements to state a cause of action under Consumer Fraud Act:

(1) a deceptive act or unfair practice occurred, (2) the defendant intended for plaintiff to rely on the deception, (3) the deception occurred in the course of conduct involving trade or commerce, (4) the plaintiff sustained actual damages, and (5) such damages were proximately caused by the defendant's deception." *Toney v. Kinsch*, No. 10 C 06375, 2012 WL 567729, at \*5 (N.D. Ill. Feb. 21, 2012) (internal quotation omitted). Because Plaintiffs cannot show that an unfair or deceptive act occurred, that there was any materially misleading communication, that Michaels had the requisite state of mind, or that Plaintiffs sustained actual damages caused by the allegedly deceptive acts, Plaintiffs' Consumer Fraud Act ("CFA") and General Business Law ("GBL") § 349 claims must be dismissed.

First, Plaintiffs fail to allege that a deceptive or unfair act occurred. The Illinois Supreme Court has held that "a consumer cannot maintain an [CFA] claim absent some communication

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Plaintiffs seek to bring this action on behalf of a nationwide class. At this stage of the case, and viewing all facts in a light most favorable to Plaintiffs, Michaels has briefed this matter applying Illinois and New York law, as those laws clearly differ. Because these and other laws differ from state-to-state, Michaels reserves its rights to argue that other states' laws should apply at later stages of this proceeding and reserves all rights to argue that the differing state laws weigh against class certification.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See also Stutman v. Chem. Bank, 95 N.Y.2d 24, 29 (N.Y. 2000) (three elements for GBL § 349 claim are (1) challenged act or practice was consumer oriented; (2) the act or practice was misleading in a material way; and (3) the plaintiff suffered injury as a result of the deceptive act).

from the defendant, either a communication containing a deceptive misrepresentation or one with a deceptive omission." *Ciszewski v. Denny's Corp.*, No. 09 C 5355, 2010 WL 1418582 (N.D. III. Apr. 7, 2010) (citing *De Bouse v. Bayer AG*, 922 N.E.2d 309, 313 (III. 2009)). In *Ciszewski*, this Court dismissed a CFA claim where the plaintiff alleged that Denny's failed to disclose that its foods contained high levels of sodium—because, as did the Plaintiffs in this case, the plaintiffs in that case failed to point to any particular communication he received from Denny's. *Id.* at \*3. Plaintiffs' failure to identify any relevant deceptive communication made by Michaels dooms their CFA claim. *Id.*; *see also In re Michaels Stores Pin Pad Litig.*, 830 F. Supp. 2d 518, 525 (N.D. III. 2011). Rather, Plaintiffs affirmatively plead that there was no communication from Michaels. (*See* Compl. ¶ 73.) And any allegation that the Company's notifications regarding the data security incident constitute a deceptive or unfair act under the CFA likewise would fall flat. As held by this Court in *Barnes & Noble*, there "must be some injury beyond mere violation of the statute" in order to state a claim. *See In re Barnes & Noble*, 2013 WL 4759588, at \*3 (rejecting argument that improper notification was sufficient to state a CFA claim).

Similarly, Plaintiffs fail to allege facts showing that the allegedly omitted information would be "likely to mislead a reasonable consumer," which allegations are necessary to their GBL claim under New York law. *Oswego Laborers' Local 214 Pension Fund v. Marine Midland Bank*, 85 N.Y.2d 20, 26 (1995). Plaintiffs' contentions are little more than "a legal conclusion couched as a factual allegation," which courts "are not bound to accept as true" under *Twombly*. 550 U.S. at 555 (internal quotation marks omitted). Plaintiffs cannot be alleging that Michaels should have disclosed that it was not immune to an attack, as it strains credulity to allege that any consumer thinks that any retailer is impervious from attacks by criminals. Nor can Plaintiffs' implication that Michaels was aware that its card processing system lacked proper

safeguards meet the plausibility test of *Twombly*, as Plaintiffs allege no facts, rather than bare conclusions, that Michaels knew of any alleged vulnerability of its system.

Under both Illinois and New York law, an alleged failure to perform promises made is simply a breach of contract and, without more, is not a deceptive trade practice. *See, e.g., Shaw v. Hyatt Int'l Corp.*, 461 F.3d 899, 901 (7th Cir. 2006) (dismissing consumer fraud claim that relied on promises made on defendant's website, and was therefore premised on breach of contract claim); *Langendorf v. Conseco Senior Health Ins. Co.*, 590 F. Supp. 2d 1020, 1023-24 (N.D. Ill. 2008) (dismissing CFA claim because it was based on little more than an alleged breach of contract); *Fleisher v. Phoenix Life Ins. Co.*, 858 F. Supp. 2d 290, 304 (S.D.N.Y. 2012) ("loss suffered as a result of [the defendant's] alleged breach of § 349 must be independent of the loss alleged under the breach of contract claim"). Thus, the facts alleged by Plaintiffs cannot form the basis of a CFA or GBL claim.

Second, and as discussed above in Section III.B, Plaintiffs' allegations of harm based on an increased risk of future identity theft, costs taken to mitigate the increased risk of identity theft, and damages as a result of "overpaying" for goods and services are insufficient, as a matter of law, to allege harm. Under the CFA, Plaintiffs must allege a purely economic loss. *Morris v. Harvey Cycle & Camper, Inc.*, 911 N.E.2d 1049, 1053 (III. App. Ct. 2009) (affirming dismissal where plaintiff alleged only emotional, not economic, loss). The alleged injuries suffered by Plaintiffs, including those based on the fear of future identity theft, are not the types of injuries permitted by the CFA.<sup>13</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See, e.g., Cooney v. Chi. Pub. Sch., 943 N.E.2d 23, 31 (Ill. App. Ct. 2010) (affirming dismissal of CFA action where plaintiff alleged injury of increased risk of future identity theft and the purchase of credit monitoring services); Worix v. MedAssets, Inc., 857 F. Supp. 2d 699, 706 (N.D. Ill. 2012) (dismissing CFA claim concluding that allegations of increased risk of identity theft and cost of credit monitoring were insufficient to establish injury); In re Michaels Stores Pin Pad Litig., 830 F. Supp. 2d 518

Nor can the allegation, as discussed above in Section III.B.3, that the allegedly deceptive conduct caused Plaintiffs' purported injuries, save Plaintiffs' claims. *See Stutman*, 95 N.Y.2d at 29; *Toney*, 2012 WL 567729, at \*5. Under New York law, deception alone—i.e., allegations of pecuniary loss arising solely from the purchase of the product—is insufficient to state a GBL § 349 claim. *See Small v. Lorillard Tobacco Co., Inc.*, 94 N.Y.2d 43, 56 (N.Y. 1999) (holding that there can be no GBL § 349 claim where plaintiffs allege that they never would have bought cigarettes if they had known that cigarettes were addictive).

Third, Plaintiffs also have failed sufficiently to allege that the allegedly unfair or deceptive practice was intentional and inured to the benefit of Michaels. Although they make conclusory allegations, the situation here is similar to that in *Richardson v. DSW, Inc.*, where this Court held that the plaintiff could not plead that the defendant "intentionally engaged in an unfair or deceptive act or practice" where an unknown person stole credit card information from a computer system. No. 05 C 4599, 2005 WL 2978755, at \*5 (N.D. III. Nov. 3, 2005) (citing *Parks v. Wells Fargo Home Mortgage, Inc.*, 398 F.3d 937, 942 (7th Cir. 2005)). The Court further held, as a matter of law, that "there is no conceivable benefit that could flow to [defendant] as a result of the fact that an unauthorized person hacked into its computers and stole purchasers' credit information." *Id.* Indeed, the suggestion that a retailer benefits from being hacked is absurd, and no facts are alleged that Michaels intentionally allowed Plaintiffs' credit card information to be stolen from its computer system.

Finally, the Complaint does not allege "fraudulent" conduct with the particularity required by the heightened pleading standard of Rule 9(b). "Because a claim for deceptive

<sup>(</sup>dismissing CFA claim for failure to plead a deceptive act and holding that "Michaels is correct that Plaintiffs suffered no actual injury under the ICFA if Plaintiffs were reimbursed for all unauthorized withdrawals and bank fees and, thus, suffered no out-of-pocket losses.").

conduct under the ICFA sounds in fraud, Plaintiff is required to plead with particularity facts such as who made the fraudulent statements or undertook the fraudulent actions, when they were made or undertaken, and how they were made or undertaken." *Typpi v. PNC Bank, N.A.*, No. 13-CV-3930, 2014 WL 296035, at \*9 (N.D. Ill. Jan. 27, 2014) (Bucklo, J.) (citing *Windy City Metal Fabricators & Supply, Inc. v. CIT Tech. Fin. Servs., Inc.*, 536 F.3d 663 (7th Cir. 2008)).

Plaintiffs here provide no specificity regarding the deceptive or fraudulent conduct, and the vague allegations "devoid of names, dates or other specific information will not suffice." *See id.*For all of these reasons, the Complaint should be dismissed under Rule 12(b)(6) for failure to state a claim.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

Plaintiffs' Complaint should be dismissed. Plaintiffs lack standing under Article III to bring these claims. And even if Plaintiffs could establish standing, the Complaint fails to state a claim upon which relief may be granted. Therefore, the Complaint must be dismissed.

Dated: May 28, 2014

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Theodore R. Scarborough

Scott Lassar Theodore R. Scarborough SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP One South Dearborn Street Chicago, IL 60603 Ph: (312) 853-7000 Fax: (312) 853-7036

slassar@sidley.com tscarborough@sidley.com

Edward Robert McNicholas (admitted *pro hac vice*) SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP 1501 K Street, NW Washington, DC 20005 Ph: (202) 736-8010

emcnicholas@sidley.com

Attorneys for Michaels Stores, Inc.

OF COUNSEL: Michelle Hartmann SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP 2001 Ross Avenue, Suite 3600 Dallas, Texas 75201 Ph: (214) 981-3300

Fax: (214) 981-3400 mhartmann@sidley.com

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this day, May 28, 2014, I electronically filed the above Memorandum of Law in Support of Defendant's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Consolidated Class Action Complaint with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will automatically send email notification of such filing to all attorneys of record.

/s/ Theodore R. Scarborough
Theodore R. Scarborough

Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 35 of 108 PageID #:334

## EXHIBIT A



Offical Documents & Communication

AFFECTED AARON BROTHERS

AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES

Press Release:

MICHAELS IDENTIFIES AND CONTAINS PREVIOUSLY ANNOUNCED DATA SECURITY ISSUE

### JANUARY 25, 2014 LETTER FROM OUR CEO

Press Release:

MICHAELS PROVIDES INFORMATION ON CERTAIN CUSTOMER PAYMENT CARDS

#### A Letter From Our CEO

January 25, 2014

#### To Our Valued Michaels Customers:

As you may have read in the news, data security attacks against retailers have become a major topic of concern. We recently learned of possible fraudulent activity on some U.S. payment cards that had been used at Michaels, suggesting we may have experienced a data security attack.

We are working closely with federal law enforcement and are conducting an investigation with the help of third-party data security experts to establish the facts. Although the investigation is ongoing, based on the information we have received and in light of the widely-reported criminal efforts to penetrate the data systems of U.S. retailers, we believe it is appropriate to notify our customers that a potential issue may have occurred.

Throughout our 40-year history, our customers have always been our number one priority and we deeply regret any inconvenience this may cause. The privacy and security of our customers' information is of critical importance to us and we are focused on addressing this issue.

We recommend that you remain vigilant by reviewing your account statements for unauthorized charges. If you believe your payment card may have been affected, you should immediately contact your bank or card issuer. If we find as part of our investigation that any of our customers were affected, we will offer identity protection and credit monitoring services to them at no cost.

We will provide updates on our website (<a href="www.michaels.com">www.michaels.com</a>) as our investigation continues. In the meantime, if you have any questions, please call us toll-free at 1-877-412-7145. Representatives will be available to answer questions beginning Sunday January 26, 2014, with operating hours Monday through Saturday from 8:00 a.m. CST to 11:00 p.m. CST and Sunday from 8:00 a.m. CST to 8:00 p.m. CST.

We apologize and truly regret any concern this may cause you.

Sincerely,

Chuck Rubin

CEO, Michaels Stores

	CONTACT	CUSTOMER SERVICE	INVESTOR RELATIONS	QUICK LINKS		
	Contact Us	Notices	SEC Filings	Teacher's Discount		
	Click to Chat	Track My Order	Annual Reports	Military Discount	Mobile Apps	Gift Cards
	Store Locator	Shipping Policy	Presentations	AARP Discount		
	1-800-MICHAELS	Return Policy	Calls & Webcasts	Site Map		
(	CORPORATE	Return Policy (Canada)	Media Relations		Bookstore	
		Coupon Policy	Press Kit			
	Corporate Governance	Terms and Conditions				
	Corporate Calendar	Your Privacy Rights				
	Careers - Work at Michaels					
	Careers - Current Associates					

© 2014 Michaels Stores. Michaels and the Michaels logo and other trademarks and logos used on this site are owned or licensed by Michaels Stores, Inc. All rights reserved.

Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 37 of 108 PageID #:336

## **EXHIBIT B**



Offical Documents & Communication

AFFECTED AARON BROTHERS STORES

AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES

Press Release:

MICHAELS IDENTIFIES AND CONTAINS PREVIOUSLY ANNOUNCED DATA SECURITY ISSUE

JANUARY 25, 2014 LETTER FROM

Press Release:

MICHAELS PROVIDES INFORMATION ON CERTAIN CUSTOMER PAYMENT CARDS

#### A Letter From Our CEO

April 17, 2014

#### Dear Valued Customers:

In January, we notified you that we might have experienced a data security incident. We wanted you to know quickly so you could take steps to monitor activity on your payment card account.

Since that time, we have continued our extensive investigation with the help of two independent, expert security firms. We have also been working closely with law enforcement authorities and coordinating with banks and payment processors to determine the facts.

After weeks of analysis, we have discovered evidence confirming that systems of Michaels stores in the United States and our subsidiary,

Aaron Brothers, were attacked by criminals using highly sophisticated malware that had not been encountered previously by either of the
security firms

We want you to know we have identified and fully contained the incident, and we can assure you the malware no longer presents a threat to customers while shopping at Michaels or Aaron Brothers.

Here are additional facts we have determined from our continuing investigation:

- The affected systems contained certain payment card information, such as payment card number and expiration date, about both
  Michaels and Aaron Brothers customers. There is no evidence that other customer personal information, such as name, address or PIN,
  was at risk in connection with this issue.
- Regarding Michaels stores, the attack targeted a limited portion of the point-of-sale systems at a varying number of stores between May 8, 2013 and January 27, 2014. Only a small percentage of payment cards used in the affected stores during the times of exposure were impacted by this issue. The analysis conducted by the security firms and the Company shows that approximately 2.6 million cards may have been impacted, which represents about 7% of payment cards used at Michaels stores in the U.S. during the relevant time period.
   The locations and potential dates of exposure for each affected Michaels store are listed on www.michaels.com.
- Regarding Aaron Brothers, the Company has confirmed that between June 26, 2013 and February 27, 2014, 54 Aaron Brothers stores
  were affected by this malware. The Company estimates that approximately 400,000 cards were potentially impacted during this period.
  The locations for each affected Aaron Brothers store are listed on www.aaronbrothers.com.
- The Company has received a limited number of reports from the payment card brands and banks of fraudulent use of payment cards potentially connected to Michaels or Aaron Brothers.

We are truly sorry and deeply regret any inconvenience this may cause. Our customers are always our number one priority and we are committed to retaining your trust and lovalty.

While we have received limited reports of fraud, we are offering identity protection and credit monitoring services to affected Michaels and Aaron Brothers customers in the U.S. for 12 months at no cost to them. We also are offering these customers a fraud assistance service for 12 months at no cost to them. This service provides customers with a trained representative to assist them in the event they experience a fraud-related issue resulting from this incident. Information on the services can be found here.

We encourage you to actively monitor all of your payment card account activity and immediately contact your bank or card issuer if you notice any suspicious activity. You can find more security tips and information on this website.

In an era where very sophisticated and determined criminals have proven capable of successfully attacking a wide range of computer networks, we must all increase our level of vigilance. We are committed to working with other parties to improve the security of payment card transactions for all consumers.

If you have any questions or would like more information, please call us toll-free at 1-877-412-7145. Representatives are available to answer your questions Monday through Saturday from 8:00 a.m. CT to 8:00 p.m. CT.

We appreciate your patience and sincerely apologize again for any inconvenience this may have caused you. Thank you for your continued support.

Sincerely,

Chuck Rubin

CEO, Michaels Stores, Inc

CONTACT	CUSTOMER SERVICE	INVESTOR RELATIONS	QUICK LINKS		
Contact Us	Notices	SEC Filings	Teacher's Discount		
Click to Chat	Track My Order	Annual Reports	Military Discount	Mobile Apps	Gift Cards
Store Locator	Shipping Policy	Presentations	AARP Discount		
1-800-MICHAELS	Return Policy	Calls & Webcasts	Site Man		

#### Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 530 Filed 05/28 F14-Page 39 of 108 PageID #:338 5/27/2014

CORPORATE

Return Policy (Canada) Coupon Policy Terms and Conditions

Media Relations Press Kit

Bookstore

Corporate Calendar Careers - Work at Michaels

Corporate Governance

Your Privacy Rights Careers - Current Associates

© 2014 Michaels Stores. Michaels and the Michaels logo and other trademarks and logos used on this site are owned or licensed by Michaels Stores, Inc. All rights reserved.

Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 40 of 108 PageID #:339

# EXHIBIT C

#### Alabama

Hubuma				
4817 Promenade Pkwy	Bessemer	AL	35022-7305	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 29, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1632 Gadsden Hwy	Birmingham	AL	35235-3104	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5271 Hwy 280 S	Birmingham	AL	35242-5315	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4601 Montgomery Hwy Ste 400	Dothan	AL	36303-1522	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1765 Montgomery Hwy S	Hoover	AL	35244-1215	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
975 Airport Rd SW	Huntsville	AL	35803-1392	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6275 University Dr Ste 1	Huntsville	AL	35806-1711	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3250 Airport Blvd, Ste E31	Mobile	AL	36606-3851	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7991 Eastchase Pkwy	Montgomery	AL	36117-7041	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1959 Cobbs Ford Rd	Prattville	AL	36066-7212	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
10200 Eastern Shore Blvd Ste 120	Spanish Fort	AL	36527-8671	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2600 McFarland Blvd E	Tuscaloosa	AL	35405-1814	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

### Alaska

3090 Mountain View Dr, Ste 130	Anchorage	AK	99501-3109	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
8571 Old Seward Hwy	Anchorage	AK	99515-2015	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
34 College Rd	Fairbanks	AK	99701-1706	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

#### Arizona

1004 N Promenade Pkwy Ste 146	Casa Grande	AZ	85194-5420	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
285 N Federal St	Chandler	AZ	85226-3192	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1500 Riordan Ranch St	Flagstaff	AZ	86001-6372	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3771 S Gilbert Rd	Gilbert	AZ	85296-7006	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5725 W Bell Rd	Glendale	AZ	85308-3869	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
9470 W Northern Ave	Glendale	AZ	85305-1104	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

1475 N Litchfield Rd	Goodyear	AZ	85338-1262	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
			1	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
6640 E McKellips Rd	Mesa	AZ	85215-2865	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1505 S Power Rd	Mesa	AZ	85206-3707	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2060 E Baseline Rd	Mesa	AZ	85204-6965	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5020 S Power Rd	Mesa	AZ	85212-3603	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			1	August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			l [	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			Ī	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
10106 W Happy Valley Pkwy	Peoria	AZ	85383-1216	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
117			1	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			1	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2766 W Peoria Ave	Phoenix	AZ	85029-5129	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2829 W Agua Fria Fwy	Phoenix	AZ	85027-3928	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1925 E Camelback Rd Ste 132	Phoenix	AZ	85016-4140	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
1920 2 0411010401114 216 102	11001111		00010 1110	August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			l	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4727 E Cactus Rd	Phoenix	AZ	85032-7725	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
., Z, Z cucius ru	11001111		1 00002 7720	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3250 Gateway Blvd Ste 504	Prescott	AZ	86303-6859	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8979 E Indian Bend Rd	Scottsdale	AZ	85250-9519	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
0,1,5 =	~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~			August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
16239 N Scottsdale Rd	Scottsdale	AZ	85254-1522	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
10209 11 2000030000 110			0020 : 1022	November 15, 2013 - January 19, 2014
13716 W Bell Rd	Surprise	AZ	85374-3804	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
55 S McClintock Dr Ste 125	Tempe	AZ	85281-2042	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7150 E Broadway Blvd	Tucson	AZ	85710-1405	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4070 N Oracle Rd	Tucson	AZ	85705-2720	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
107017014010144	100001		00700 2720	August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			l	October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
			l	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1161 W Irvington Rd	Tucson	AZ	85714-1165	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
The state of the s	1 400011	112	3371.1103	August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			[	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3749 W Ina Rd	Tucson	AZ	85741-2001	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
320 W 32nd St	Yuma	AZ	85364-8128	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
220 11 32Hu St	1 uma	ΛL	0000 <del>1</del> -0120	way 0, 2013 - July 29, 2013

### Arkansas

4155 Phoenix Ave	Fort Smith	AR	72903-6013	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1438 Higdon Ferry Rd	Hot Springs	AR	71913-6419	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
11400 W Markham St	Little Rock	AR	72211-2806	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4126 E McCain Blvd	North Little Rock	AR	72117-2523	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

### California

26503 Aliso Creek Rd	Aliso Viejo	CA	92656-2882	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9350 Rosedale Hwy	Bakersfield	CA	93312-2143	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2720 Ming Ave	Bakersfield	CA	93312-2143	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2315 E Imperial Hwy Ste D	Brea	CA	92821-6112	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
2313 E Imperial Trwy Ste D	Dica	CA	92021-0112	August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
5501 Lone Tree Way	Brentwood	CA	94513-5316	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014 May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
3301 Lone Tree way	Brentwood	CA	94313-3310	
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
8341 LaPalma Ave	D Dl.	CA	00620 2207	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
8341 LaPaima Ave	Buena Park	CA	90620-3207	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
1551 N.W	D 1 1	C A	01500 1647	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1551 N Victory Pl	Burbank	CA	91502-1647	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
251.0	G 111	G 1	02010 6022	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
351 Carmen Dr Ste A	Camarillo	CA	93010-6033	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2041 Dr Martin Luther King Jr Pkwy	Chico	CA	95928-6797	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4020 Grand Ave	Chino	CA	91710-5436	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 29, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
10107		~ .	01011 0011	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1242 Broadway	Chula Vista	CA	91911-2911	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			-	October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
## T		~ .	0.5.510.0001	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
6120 Birdcage Centre Ln	Citrus Heights	CA	95610-8004	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
			-	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
21630 Valley Blvd	City of Industry	CA	91789-5238	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
255 W Shaw Ave	Clovis	CA	93612-3602	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4925 Junipero Serra Blvd	Colma	CA	94014-3216	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
	_			December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3469 Grand Oaks	Corona		92881-4633	May 8, 2013 - January 18, 2014
610 W 17th St	Costa Mesa	CA	92627-3654	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
20640 Homestead Rd	Cupertino	CA	95014-0451	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
12100 Lakewood Blvd	Downey	CA	90242-2660	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7890 Dublin Blvd	Dublin	CA	94568-2924	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2398-A Jamacha Rd	El Cajon	CA	92019-4367	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
564 Danenberg Dr	El Centro	CA	92243-8510	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
		1	<b> </b>	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7611 Laguna Blvd	Elk Grove	CA	95758-5061	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3991 Hollis St	Emeryville	CA	94608-3558	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

335 N El Camino Real	Encinitas	CA	92024-2810	May 8 2012 Approx 11 2012
333 N El Callillo Real	Encillitas	CA	72024-2810	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013 August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - October 8, 2013
17230 Ventura Blvd	Encino	CA	91316-4008	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014 May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
17230 Ventura Bivu	Encino	CA	91310-4008	•
000 11111 11 71		~ .		December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
820 W Valley Pkwy	Escondido	CA	92025-2537	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
000 11111 1 0 0 0		G.1	05502 2020	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
800 W Harris St Ste 26	Eureka	CA	95503-3929	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
1210 G	D : 6: 11	G.1	0.4522 5002	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1310 Gateway Blvd	Fairfield	CA	94533-6903	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
2515 5 511 11 6		~ .	07.500 5101	October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2715 E Bidwell St	Folsom	CA	95630-6404	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
1.500.0		~ .	0000 5 7 100	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
15228 Summit Ave	Fontana	CA	92336-5489	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
26752 Portola Pkwy	Foothill Ranch	CA	92610-1712	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
39170 Argonaut Way	Fremont	CA	94538-1304	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7400 N Blackstone Ave	Fresno	CA	93720-4301	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
201 Orangefair Mall	Fullerton	CA	92832-3038	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
6745 Camino Arroyo	Gilroy	CA	95020-7075	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
219 N Glendale Ave	Glendale	CA	91206-4455	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
187 N Fairview Ave	Goleta	CA	93117-2304	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
18030 Chatsworth St	Granada Hills	CA	91344-5607	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
204 N 12th Ave	Hanford	CA	93230-5972	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			ļ	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
14370 Ocean Gate Ave	Hawthorne	CA	90250-6732	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2981 W Florida Ave	Hemet	CA	92545-3616	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7600A Edinger Ave	Huntington Beach	CA	92647-3605	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3340 W Century Blvd	Inglewood	CA	90303-1305	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
	·			·

1500 W Imperial Hwy	La Habra	CA	90631-6967	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9108 Fletcher Pkwy	La Mesa	CA	91942-3424	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1951 Foothill Blvd	La Verne	CA	91750-3501	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4000 Hardwick St	Lakewood	CA	90712-2349	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
44679 Valley Central Way	Lancaster	CA	93534-6537	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
j j				August 13, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
605 N H St	Lompoc	CA	93436-4518	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7340 Carson Blvd	Long Beach	CA	90808-2360	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
738 Wall St	Los Angeles	CA	90014-2316	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 20, 2014
11250 Olympic Blvd	Los Angeles	CA	90064	May 31, 2013 - July 29, 2013
121 General Stillwell Dr	Marina	CA	93933-6242	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
30274 Haun Rd	Menifee	CA	92584-6822	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
655 Fairfield Dr	Merced	CA	95348-2402	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
136 Ranch Dr	Milpitas	CA	95035-5101	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6381 Pats Ranch Rd	Mira Loma	CA	91752-4431	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
25310 Marguerite Pkwy	Mission Viejo	CA	92692-2902	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
-				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3900 Sisk Rd Ste A1	Modesto	CA	95356-3125	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 15, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
729 E Huntington Dr	Monrovia	CA	91016-3613	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
816 New Los Angeles Ave	Moorpark	CA	93021-3585	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2415 Charleston Rd	Mountain View	CA	94043-1629	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
25686 The Old Road N	Newhall	CA	91381-1707	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2649 Vista Way	Oceanside	CA	92054-6342	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1802 E Katella Ave	Orange	CA	92867-5107	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
44-150 Town Center Way Ste B-3	Palm Desert	CA	92260-2752	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2465 E Palm Canyon, Bldg 3	Palm Springs	CA	92264-7001	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
39626 10th St W Ste B	Palmdale	CA	93551-3000	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
	i	1	1	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

1155 E Colorado Blvd	Pasadena	CA	91106-1806	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2055 Theatre Dr	Paso Robles	CA	93446-9629	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1359 N McDowell Blvd	Petaluma	CA	94954-1114	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1450 Fitzgerald Dr	Pinole	CA	94564-2227	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
60 Gregory Ln	Pleasant Hill	CA	94523-3321	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
10913 Olson Dr	Rancho Cordova	CA	95670-5659	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
10788 Foothill Blvd Ste 103	Rancho Cucamong	CA	91730-3884	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1070 Hilltop Dr	Redding	CA	96003-3810	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
1	Ü			August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
27534 Lugonia Ave	Redlands	CA	92374-2017	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
100 Woodside Plaza	Redwood City	CA	94061-2553	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
			, , , , , ,	August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2704 Canyon Springs Pkwy	Riverside	CA	92507-0933	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
The state of the s			,	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
10345 Magnolia Ave	Riverside	CA	92505-1809	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			,	August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1192 Galleria Blvd	Roseville	CA	95678-1950	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
17584 Colima Rd	Rowland Heights	CA	91748-1752	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3400 El Camino Ave	Sacramento	CA	95821-6310	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3691 Truxel Rd	Sacramento	CA	95834-3604	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
			,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
860 Northridge Shopping Center	Salinas	CA	93906-2007	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
ooo rommage snopping center	Sumus	CII	)3)00 2007	August 12, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
937 Avenida Pico	San Clemente	CA	92673-3908	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3994 Clairemont Mesa Blvd	San Diego	CA	92117-2714	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2740 Midway Dr	San Diego	CA	92110-3203	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
12060 Carmel Mountain Rd	San Diego	CA	92110-3203	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
12000 Carmer Mountain Ru	Ban Diego	CA	72120-4003	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
				December 11, 2013 - January 16, 2014

1652 Camino Del Rio N	Con Diago	CA	92108-1514	May 9 2012 Oatakan 9 2012
1032 Camino Del Kio N	San Diego	CA	92108-1514	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
1444 IZ D 1	C I	C A	05110 2000	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1444 Kooser Rd	San Jose	CA	95118-3800	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			-	October 15, 2013 - November 23, 2013
1,000 g	G T	G.	05120 5100	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1600 Saratoga Ave Ste 433	San Jose	CA	95129-5108	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
	a -	~ .	07100 1 571	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
5550 Snell Ave	San Jose	CA	95123-1651	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
561 Coleman Ave	San Jose	CA	95110-2047	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
			_	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
		~ .		December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2040 Tully Rd	San Jose	CA	95122-1300	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
15100 Hesperian Blvd	San Leandro	CA	94578-3600	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			_	August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			_	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3880 Broad St	San Luis Obispo	CA	93401-7110	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1750 S Delaware St	San Mateo	CA	94402-2651	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
400 Las Gallinas Ave	San Rafael	CA	94903-3618	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3309B S Bristol St	Santa Ana	CA	92704-7245	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1934 S Broadway	Santa Maria	CA	93454-7808	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2775 Santa Rosa Ave	Santa Rosa	CA	95407-6232	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
230 Town Center Pkwy	Santee	CA	92071-5803	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
628 W Hammer Ln	Stockton	CA	95210-3701	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
818 W El Camino Real	Sunnyvale	CA	94087-1153	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
27471 Ynez Rd	Temecula	CA	92591-4612	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4240 Pacific Coast Hwy	Torrance	CA	90505-5526	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2940 W Grant Line Rd	Tracy	CA	95304-7901	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3151 Geer Rd	Turlock	CA	95382-1118	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1212 Irvine Blvd	Tustin	CA	92780-3531	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2807 Park Ave	Tustin	CA	92782-2711	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1215 Airport Park Blvd	Ukiah	CA	95482-7400	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
1				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			1	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
			1	December 11, 2015 - January 18, 2014
31080 Dyer St	Union City	CA	94587-1768	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
31080 Dyer St 357 S Mountain Ave	Union City	CA	94587-1768 91786-7032	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

1611 E Monte Vista Ave, Ste A	Vacaville	CA	95688-3107	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1051 Helen Power Dr	Vacaville	CA	95687-3507	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
105 Plaza Dr Ste 101	Vallejo	CA	94591-3703	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4850 Telephone Rd	Ventura	CA	93003-5234	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
12353 Mariposa Rd Ste C-2	Victorville	CA	92392-6014	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4248 S Mooney Blvd	Visalia	CA	93277-9306	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1851 University Dr	Vista	CA	92083-7774	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
940 Lakes Dr	West Covina	CA	91790-2926	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6625 Fallbrook Ave	West Hills	CA	91307-3520	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5780 Lindero Canyon Rd	Westlake Village	CA	91362-4063	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
13410 Whittier Blvd	Whittier	CA	90605-1932	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2175 Bronze Star Dr	Woodland	CA	95776-5406	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 19, 2014
23021 Savi Ranch Pkwy	Yorba Linda	CA	92887-4669	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1120 Harter Rd	Yuba City	CA	95993-2642	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

#### Colorado

Colorado				
6352 S Central St Unit A	Aurora	CO	80016-5326	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
80 S Abilene St	Aurora	CO	80012-1406	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4800 Baseline Rd Ste A-108	Boulder	CO	80303-2643	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2253 Prairie Center Pkwy	Brighton	CO	80601-7000	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
5650 Allen Way Ste 108	Castle Rock	CO	80108-7621	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3040 N Powers Blvd	Colorado Springs	CO	80922-2803	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7664 N Academy Blvd	Colorado Springs	CO	80920-3208	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2140 Southgate Rd	Colorado Springs	CO	80906-2659	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2780 S Colorado Blvd Ste 306-B	Denver	CO	80222-6613	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
9565 E County Line Rd	Englewood	CO	80112-3501	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
-				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 49 of 108 PageID #:348 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

4330 S College Ave	Ft. Collins	CO	80525-3021	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2464 Hwy 6 and 50 Ste E	<b>Grand Junction</b>	CO	81505-1108	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4743 W 29th St Unit A	Greeley	CO	80634-8363	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
9291 S Broadway	Highlands Ranch	CO	80129-5631	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
441 S Wadsworth Blvd	Lakewood	CO	80226-3110	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5382 S Wadsworth Blvd	Littleton	CO	80123-2201	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
205 Ken Pratt Blvd Ste 200	Longmont	CO	80501-8991	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
11425 S Twenty Mile Rd	Parker	CO	80134-4918	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
410 Marshall Rd	Superior	CO	80027-8623	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
931 E 120th Ave	Thornton	CO	80233-5710	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
10450 Town Center Dr, Ste 400	Westminster	CO	80021-6083	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

#### Connecticut

Connecticut				
315 W Main St	Avon	CT	06001-3686	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
14 Candlewood Lake Rd	Brookfield	CT	06804-2529	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2091 Killingly Commons Dr	Dayville	CT	06241-2190	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
25 Hazard Ave	Enfield	CT	06082-3725	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
160 River Rd, Ste A-150	Lisbon	CT	06351-1250	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
1520 Pleasant Valley Rd	Manchester	CT	06040-1637	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
95 Storrs Rd, Ste 1A	Mansfield	CT	06250	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
533 S Broad St Ste E2	Meriden	CT	06450-6661	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
79 Turnpike Sq	Milford	CT	06460-2758	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

## Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 50 of 108 PageID #:349 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

600 Hartford Rd	New Britain	CT	06053-1527	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
196 Kitts Ln	Newington	CT	06111-4250	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
170 Universal Dr N	North Haven	CT	06473-3117	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2233 Summer St	Stamford	CT	06905-4609	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
295 Union St	Waterbury	CT	06706-1248	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
915 Hartford Tpke	Waterford	CT	06385-4227	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

#### **Delaware**

Delaware				
1165 N Dupont Hwy Ste 2	Dover	DE	19901-2008	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
800 Centre Blvd	Newark	DE	19702-3213	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
18902 Rehoboth Mall Blvd	Rehoboth Beach	DE	19971-6132	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3080 Brandywine Pkwy	Wilmington	DE	19803-5026	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

### Florida

Florida				
880 W State Rd 436, Ste 1001	Altamonte Springs	FL	32714-3047	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
20609 Biscayne Blvd	Aventura	FL	33180-1536	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8903 Glades Rd, Ste C-1	Boca Raton	FL	33434-4023	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
800 N Congress Ave, Ste 1	Boynton Beach	FL	33426-3301	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
831 Cortez Rd W	Bradenton	FL	34207-1433	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2564 W Brandon Blvd	Brandon	FL	33511-4719	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
7131 Coastal Blvd	Brooksville	FL	34613-5842	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
		1		August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
527 SW Pine Island Rd	Cape Coral	FL	33991-1962	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 51 of 108 PageID #:350 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014	14829 N Dale Mabry Hwy	Carrollwood	FL	33618-2027	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
26.31 Guff To Bay Blvd					•
Clemont   FL   34711-6877   May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013   December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014   December 11, 2013 - January 19, 2015   December 12, 2013 - December 13, 2013 - December 13, 2013 - December 13, 2013 - December 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014   December 12, 2013 - December 12, 2013 - December 13, 2013 - December 13, 2013 - December 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014   December 12, 2013 - December 12, 2013 - December 13, 2013 - December 13, 2013 - December 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014   December 14,	2631 Gulf To Bay Blvd	Clearwater	FL	33759-4936	•
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014	2315 S US Hwy 27	Clermont		34711-6877	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
2075 N University Dr	·			Ī	·
Davenport	2075 N University Dr	Coral Springs	FL	33071-6132	
August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013   October 16, 2013 - Noromber 23, 2013   December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014					·
December 11, 2013 - November 24, 2013		1			·
Davie   FL   33324-5849     December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014				1	<u> </u>
1922 S University Dr					
December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014	1922 S University Dr	Davie	FL	33324-5849	
December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014	ĺ			1	
2500 W International Speedway Blvd Ste   Dayrtona Beach   FL   3214-1119   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013				Ī	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
Deerfield Beach   FL   33442-9417   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	2500 W International Speedway Blvd Ste	Daytona Beach	FL	32114-1119	•
1630 S Federal Hwy			FL	33442-9417	· · ·
Destin			+		
August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013   December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014					
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014				1	·
Fleming Island					e , ,
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	1993 East West Pkwy	Fleming Island	FL	32003-6350	
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014				1	
Fort Myers   FL   33907-1303   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013				1	
Ft. Lauderdale	5001 S Cleveland Ave	Fort Myers	FL	33907-1303	
August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013   October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013		•			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013   December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014				1	
December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014					<u> </u>
Same Strict					
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	3644 SW Archer Rd	Gainesville	FL	32608-2420	
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014				1	
Hialeah   FL   33012-3605   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013				Ī	
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	500 W 49th St, Ste B	Hialeah	FL	33012-3605	
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014	3601 Oakwood Blvd	Hollywood	FL	33020-7111	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
December 12, 2013 - July 29, 2013   Substitute   FL   Substitute   FL   Substitute   FL   Substitute   Substitute   FL   Substitute   FL   Substitute   FL   Substitute   FL   Substitute   Substitute   FL   FL   Substitute   FL   Substitute   FL   FL   FL   FL   FL   FL   FL   F				Ī	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
13740 Beach Blvd Ste 200   Jacksonville   FL   32224-6035   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013     1111 San Jose Blvd Ste 31   Jacksonville   FL   32223-7274   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   32218-7228   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   32218-7228   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   32225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   32225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   32225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   32225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   32225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013     13281 City Station Dr   Jacksonville   FL   3225-8180				Ī	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
Till I San Jose Blvd Ste 31	2535 NE 10 Ct	Homestead	FL	33033-4719	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
13281 City Station Dr	13740 Beach Blvd Ste 200	Jacksonville	FL	32224-6035	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
FL   3225-8180   May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013	11111 San Jose Blvd Ste 31	Jacksonville	FL	32223-7274	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014  9041 Southside Blvd Ste 140  Jacksonville  FL  32256-5484  May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013 August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014  6001 Argyle Forrest Blvd Ste 25  Jacksonville  FL  32244-6127  May 8, 2013 - January 18, 2014  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013 August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  630 US Hwy 441  Lady Lake  FL  32159-3777  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013 August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013	13281 City Station Dr	Jacksonville	FL	32218-7228	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014  9041 Southside Blvd Ste 140  Jacksonville  FL  32256-5484  May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013  August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014  6001 Argyle Forrest Blvd Ste 25  Jacksonville  FL  32244-6127  May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  630 US Hwy 441  Lady Lake  FL  32159-3777  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013  October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013	651-800 Commerce Center Dr	Jacksonville	FL	32225-8180	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014				1	August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
9041 Southside Blvd Ste 140  Jacksonville  FL  32256-5484  May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013  August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014  May 8, 2013 - January 18, 2014  May 8, 2013 - January 18, 2014  May 8, 2013 - January 19, 2013  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 16, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013				Ī	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014  6001 Argyle Forrest Blvd Ste 25  Jacksonville  FL  32244-6127  May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  630 US Hwy 441  Lady Lake  FL  32159-3777  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013				1	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
October 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014  6001 Argyle Forrest Blvd Ste 25  Jacksonville  FL  32244-6127  May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  630 US Hwy 441  Lady Lake  FL  32159-3777  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 16, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013	9041 Southside Blvd Ste 140	Jacksonville	FL	32256-5484	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
Second Register For Fig. 10   Second Register Fig. 2013   Second Register Fig. 32244-6127   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013				1	August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
3278 N John Young Pkwy  Kissimmee  FL  34741-7549  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  630 US Hwy 441  Lady Lake  FL  32159-3777  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013				1	October 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014
August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  630 US Hwy 441 Lady Lake FL 32159-3777 May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013 August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013	6001 Argyle Forrest Blvd Ste 25	Jacksonville	FL	32244-6127	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  630 US Hwy 441  Lady Lake  FL  32159-3777  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013	3278 N John Young Pkwy	Kissimmee	FL	34741-7549	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  630 US Hwy 441  Lady Lake  FL  32159-3777  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013					August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  630 US Hwy 441  Lady Lake  FL  32159-3777  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013					-
630 US Hwy 441 Lady Lake FL 32159-3777 May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013  October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013					
August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013	630 US Hwy 441	Lady Lake	FL	32159-3777	· · ·
October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013		-			•

4017 N 98	Lakeland	FL	33809-3854	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
TOT / IN 70	Lanciallu	LF	33007-3034	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
10500 Ulmerton Rd Ste 250	Largo	FL	33771-3503	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
10300 Ulmerton Rd Ste 230	Largo	ГL	33//1-3303	•
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
12427 GW 004 G	7.6.	TT	22106 1071	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
12425 SW 88th St	Miami	FL	33186-1871	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8354 S Dixie Hwy	Miami	FL	33143-7714	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
8287 W Flagler St	Miami	FL	33144-2070	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2253 Pine Ridge Rd Ste B	Naples	FL	34109-2032	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2701 SW College Rd #700	Ocala	FL	34474-8429	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9649 W Colonial Dr	Ocoee	FL	34761-6901	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - January 18, 2014
971 Harley Strickland Blvd	Orange City	FL	32763-7967	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
	,			August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1766 Sand Lake Rd	Orlando	FL	32809-7628	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
1,00 Sund Zund 1td	Onundo		52009 7020	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8081 Turkey Lake Rd Ste 400	Orlando	FL	32819-7387	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
400 N Alafaya Trl	Orlando	FL	32828-4392	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
1400 IV Alaraya III	Oriando	1 L	32020-4372	September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1115 Vidina Place Ste 145	Oviedo	FL	32765-9137	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
1113 Vidilla Flace Ste 143	Oviedo	PL	32703-9137	
				August 12, 2013 - October 9, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
11240 7	D 1 D 1 C 1	TT	22410 2641	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
11240 Legacy Ave	Palm Beach Garder	FL	33410-3641	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
707077 1007	2.0		224542454	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5250 Hwy 100 E	Palm Coast	FL	32164-2461	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
33561 US Hwy 19 N	Palm Harbor	FL	34684-2600	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
601 W 23rd St	Panama City	FL	32405-3922	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
11300 Pines Blvd	Pembroke Pines	FL	33026-4012	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4721 Bayou Blvd	Pensacola	FL	32503-2607	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
7240 US Hwy 19 N	Pinellas Park	FL	33781-4612	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
229 W Alexander St	Plant City	FL	33563	July 19, 2013 - July 29, 2013
12200 W Sunrise Blvd	Plantation	FL	33323-2227	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
18700 Veterans Blvd Ste 12	Port Charlotte	FL	33954-1018	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
			.,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	IVIAV O. ZVIJ = JUIV ZZ. ZVIJ

5507 S Williamson Blvd	Port Orange	FL	32128-7370	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9646 US Hwy 19 N	Port Richey	FL	34668-4642	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
10872 SW Village Pkwy	Port St. Lucie	FL	34987-2357	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			Ī	August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
			Ī	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			Ī	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
521 N State Rd 7	Royal Palm Beach	FL	33411-3524	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
107 Towne Center Blvd	Sanford	FL	32771-7404	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6549 S Tamiami Trail	Sarasota	FL	34231-4827	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
127 N Cattleman Rd	Sarasota	FL	34243-4743	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			Ī	August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1740 US 27 N	Sebring	FL	33870-1921	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
310 C B L Dr	St. Augustine	FL	32086-5165	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2026 66th St N	St Petersburg	FL	33710-4710	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2500 NW Federal Hwy	Stuart	FL	34994-9316	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
·				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1524 Governors Square Blvd	Tallahassee	FL	32301-3020	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
11643 W Hillsborough Ave	Tampa	FL	33635-9736	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3804 S Dale Mabry Hwy Ste A	Tampa	FL	33611-1402	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
18081 Highwoods Preserve Pkwy	Tampa	FL	33647-1761	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
6140 20th St	Vero Beach	FL	32966-1023	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2221 Town Center Ave, Ste 101	Viera	FL	32940-6102	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5913 Wesley Grove Blvd	Wesley Chapel	FL	33544-8411	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
-				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
205 Palm Bay Rd NE Ste 141	West Melbourne	FL	32904-8602	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2021 Okeechobee Blvd	West Palm Beach	FL	33409-4105	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
501 N Orlando Ave Suite 135	Winter Park	FL	32789-7313	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			[	August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			[	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

Georgia

Ocorgia				
3335 Cobb Pkwy N Ste 500	Acworth	GA	30101-3940	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1221 N Westover Blvd	Albany	GA	31707-6600	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7491 N Point Pkwy	Alpharetta	GA	30022-4846	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3055 Atlanta Hwy	Athens	GA	30606-3334	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2625 Piedmont Rd NE	Atlanta	GA	30324-3011	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

211 Robert C Daniel Jr Pkwy	Augusta	GA	30909-0800	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
916 Loganville Hwy Ste 1600	Bethlehem	GA	30620	May 10, 2013 - July 29, 2013
480 Glynn Isle	Brunswick	GA	31525-2931	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
Too Grynn Isle	Drunswick	O/ i	31323 2731	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			•	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1705 Mall of Georgia Blvd Ste 600	Buford	GA	30519-4982	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
1700 Main of Georgia Diva See 000	Buroru	011	30317 1702	August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1445 Riverstone Pkwy Ste 100	Canton	GA	30114-5624	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
This reversione TRWy Ste 100	Canton	071	30111 3021	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1591 Bradley Park Dr Ste C	Columbus	GA	31904-3071	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
1391 Bradiey Fairk Dr Ste C	Columbus	071	31701 3071	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			ŀ	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1578 Dogwood Dr SE	Conyers	GA	30013-5041	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1200 Market Place Blvd	Cumming	GA	30041-7923	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
1200 Warket Flace Bivu	Cumming	UA	30041-7923	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			•	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
0265 The Landing Dr. Sto. C	Douglasville	GA	30135-7122	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
9365 The Landing Dr Ste C	Douglasville	GA	30133-7122	·
1155 Mount Vernon Hwy Ste 150	Danis de	CA	20229 5441	December 12, 2013 - January 20, 2014
1155 Mount Vernon Hwy Ste 150	Dunwoody	GA	30338-5441	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
	- "	~ .	2021115	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
27 Hudson Plaza	Fayetteville	GA	30214-1658	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2025 Battlefield Pkwy	Fort Oglethorpe	GA	30742-4025	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
983 Dawsonville Hwy NW, Ste A	Gainesville	GA	30501-2618	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4794 Jimmy Lee Smith Pkwy Ste 112	Hiram	GA	30141-2764	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
860 Cobb Place Blvd, Ste 140	Kennesaw	GA	30144-4864	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4668 Presidential Pkwy	Macon	GA	31206-8708	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4281 Roswell Rd Ste C	Marietta	GA	30062-6488	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 29, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 20, 2013
1940 Jonesboro Rd	McDonough	GA	30253-5959	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
575 Bullsboro Dr	Newnan	GA	30265-1045	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
	1			December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
260 Pooler Pkwy	Pooler	GA	31322	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1432 Turner McCall Blvd SW	Rome	GA	30161-6072	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
612A W Crossville Rd	Roswell	GA	30075-2560	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
8108 Abercorn St Ste 400	Savannah	GA	31406-3419	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
	Smyrna	GA	30080-2801	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2540 Cumberland Blvd, Ste C				

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 55 of 108 PageID #:354 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

1977 Scenic Hwy N Ste G	Snellville	GA	30078-2137	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3630 Peachtree Pkwy Ste 400	Suwanee	GA	30024-1029	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4000 LaVista Rd	Tucker	GA	30084-5205	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1200C N St Augustine Rd	Valdosta	GA	31601-3534	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2620 Watson Blvd Ste C	Warner Robins	GA	31093-2950	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

### Idaho

0622 F 11' D 1	ln ·	TD	02700 0622	M 0 2012 A
8633 Franklin Rd	Boise	ID	83709-0632	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
225 W Canfield Ave Ste B	Coeur D'Alene	ID	83815-7736	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2345 E 17th St Ste B	Idaho Falls	ID	83404-6511	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1720 W Pullman Rd	Moscow	ID	83843-4015	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
16474 N Marketplace Blvd	Nampa	ID	83687-5018	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1988 Bridgeview Blvd	Twin Falls	ID	83301-3079	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

#### Illinois

Illinois				
742 S Randall Rd	Algonquin	IL	60102-5915	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
402 W Army Trail Dr	Bloomingdale	IL	60108-1379	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1515 N State Rte 50	Bourbonnais	IL	60914-4429	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2109 N Prospect Ave	Champaign	IL	61822-1238	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3131 N Clark St	Chicago	IL	60657-4413	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1101 S Canal St #002	Chicago	IL	60607-4901	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9680 S Ridgeland Ave	Chicago Ridge	IL	60415-2609	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2341 Sycamore Rd	DeKalb	IL	60115-2007	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

1206 75th St	Downers Grove	IL	60516-4235	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6639 Edwardsville Crossing Dr	Edwardsville	IL	62025-2704	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
9140 S Western Ave	Evergreen Park	IL	60805	July 26, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1506 S Randall Rd	Geneva	IL	60134-4610	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2231 Willow Rd	Glenview	IL	60025-7636	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6635 Grand Ave	Gurnee	IL	60031-4591	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
180 S Mannheim Rd	Hillside	IL	60162-1821	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2600 N Sutton Rd	Hoffman Estates	IL	60192-3706	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2800 Plainfield Rd	Joliet	IL	60435-1167	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
20505 N Rand Rd, Suite 230	Kildeer	IL	60047-3004	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1017 W Lane Rd	Machesney Park	IL	61115-1622	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2244 N Richmond Rd	McHenry	IL	60050-1423	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2768 Aurora Ave	Naperville	IL	60540-1001	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2374 E Lincoln Hwy	New Lenox	IL	60451-9533	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7225 W Dempster St	Niles	IL	60714-2107	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
1				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
200 Greenbriar Dr, Ste A	Normal	IL	61761-6282	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7010 W Forest Preserve Dr	Norridge	IL	60706-7123	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1780 Orchard Gateway Blvd	North Aurora	IL	60542-6502	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2013
7231 W 24th St	North Riverside	IL	60546-1406	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
15102 S La Grange Rd	Orland Park	IL	60462-3709	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1620 Douglas Rd	Oswego	IL	60543-5110	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
5212 N Big Hollow Rd	Peoria	IL	61615-3404	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6301 E State St	Rockford	IL	61108-2540	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1420 E Golf Rd	Schaumburg	IL	60173-4902	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3800 Green Mount Crossing Dr	Shiloh	IL	62269-7286	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
7055 Central Ave	Skokie	IL	60077-3272	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

## Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 57 of 108 PageID #:356 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

3119 S Veterans Pkwy	Springfield	IL	62704-6565	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 14, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7310 191st St	Tinley Park	IL	60487-9361	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
701 N Milwaukee Ave, Ste 208	Vernon Hills	IL	60061-1530	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7155 S Kingery Hwy	Willowbrook	IL	60527-5525	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

#### Indiana

Indiana				
10352 E US Hwy 36	Avon	IN	46123-7050	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
120 N Gates Dr	Bloomington	IN	47404-4873	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
14670 Greyhound Plaza	Carmel	IN	46032-1391	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1020 Veterans Pkwy Ste 800	Clarksville	IN	47129-2391	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
6212 E Lloyd Expy	Evansville	IN	47715-2718	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4230 W Jefferson Blvd	Fort Wayne	IN	46804-6818	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
10240 Maysville Rd	Fort Wayne	IN	46835-9590	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3826 Midway Rd	Goshen	IN	46526-5852	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
10323 Indianapolis Blvd	Highland	IN	46322-3509	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9835 E Washington St	Indianapolis	IN	46229-2623	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8030 Hwy 31	Indianapolis	IN	46227-6226	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5750 W 86th St	Indianapolis	IN	46278-1338	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
5151 E 82nd St Ste 300	Indianapolis	IN	46250-1625	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3500 State Hwy 38 E Ste 200	Lafayette	IN	47905-5165	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2384 E 79th Ave	Merrillville	IN	46410-5740	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
6502 Grape Rd Room 730	Mishawaka	IN	46545-1102	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
91 Silhavy Rd Ste 141	Valparaiso	IN	46383-4425	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

### Iowa

1725 SE Delaware Ave	Ankeny	IA	50021-3936	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2515 Corridor Way Ste 4	Coralville	IA	52241-2700	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4010 E 53rd St	Davenport	IA	52807-3033	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2455 NW Arterial	Dubuque	IA	52002-0492	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1470 Twixt Town Rd	Marion	IA	52302-3080	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5001 Sergeant Rd Ste 60	Sioux City	IA	51106-4777	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1404 22nd St	West Des Moines	IA	50266-1403	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

#### Kansas

THE ISSUED				
3106 Iowa St Ste 210	Lawrence	KS	66046-5202	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
14685 W 119th St	Olathe	KS	66062-8600	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9290 Metcalf Ave	Overland Park	KS	66212-1478	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
12140 Blue Valley Pkwy	Overland Park	KS	66213-2606	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
15210 Shawnee Mission Pkwy	Shawnee	KS	66217-9315	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2040 SW Wanamaker Rd Ste 101	Topeka	KS	66604-3827	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
11835 E Kellogg Dr	Wichita	KS	67207-1939	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2441 N Maize Rd Ste 2201	Wichita	KS	67205-7935	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

Kentucky

Kentucky				
2313 Gary Farms Blvd	Bowling Green	KY	42104-4418	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1990 N Dixie Ave	Elizabethtown	KY	42701-8853	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4999 Houston Rd Ste 200	Florence	KY	41042-1365	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7000 John Davis Dr #200	Frankfort	KY	40601-9702	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1953 Pavilion Way	Lexington	KY	40509-2211	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
150 W Lowry Ln Ste 170	Lexington	KY	40503-3008	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
10221 Westport Rd	Louisville	KY	40241-2147	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1955 S Hurstbourne Pkwy	Louisville	KY	40220-1645	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
5187 Hinkleville Rd Ste A	Paducah	KY	42001-9667	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2025 Lantern Ridge Dr	Richmond	KY	40475-6010	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

### Louisiana

2643 S MacArthur Dr	Alexandria	LA	71301-2920	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9616 Airline Hwy	Baton Rouge	LA	70815-5505	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3047 E Texas Hwy	Bossier City	LA	71111-3207	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
69290 Hwy 21	Covington	LA	70433-7214	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1200 S Clearview Pkwy Ste 1302	Harahan	LA	70123-2390	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1601 Westbank Expy, Ste C	Harvey	LA	70058-4312	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1729 Martin Luther King Jr Blvd	Houma	LA	70360-2409	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5624 Johnston St	Lafayette	LA	70503-5301	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3425 Derek Dr	Lake Charles	LA	70607-7533	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
8851 Veterans Memorial Blvd	Metairie	LA	70003-5278	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4429 Pecanland Mall Dr, Ste 7	Monroe	LA	71203-7003	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - December 23, 2013
7440 Youree Dr	Shreveport	LA	71105-5536	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 15, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

### Maine

13 Marketplace Dr	Augusta	ME	04330-4637	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
106 Shops Way	Biddeford	ME	04005-9436	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 29, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
490 Payne Rd	Scarborough	ME	04074-8929	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

## Maryland

will yillid				
2309 B Forest Dr	Annapolis	MD	21401-3833	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5212 Campbell Blvd	Baltimore	MD	21236-4983	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
640 Marketplace Dr	Bel Air	MD	21014-4338	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4511 Mitchellville Rd	Bowie	MD	20716-3111	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
45045 Worth Ave	California	MD	20619-2400	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 20, 2014
9041 Snowden River Pkwy	Columbia	MD	21046-1657	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4360 Montgomery Rd	Ellicott City	MD	21043-6006	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5541 Urbana Pike	Frederick	MD	21704-7325	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
821 Center Point Way	Gaithersburg	MD	20878-5458	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

## Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 60 of 108 PageID #:359 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

20902 Frederick Rd	Germantown	MD	20876-4134	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
16 Mountain Rd	Glen Burnie	MD	21060-7974	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
17225 Cole Rd Ste 2	Hagerstown	MD	21740-6901	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 15, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
7665 Arundel Mills Blvd	Hanover	MD	21076-1305	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
14240 Baltimore Ave	Laurel	MD	20707-5006	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
30-36 W Ridgely Rd	Lutherville-Timoni	MD	21093-5112	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
12641 Ocean Gateway, Ste 200	Ocean City	MD	21842-9594	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9616 Reistertown Rd, Ste 125	Owings Mills	MD	21117	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1509 Rockville Pike	Rockville	MD	20852-1601	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
113 E North Point Dr	Salisbury	MD	21801-2283	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
13850 Georgia Ave	Silver Spring	MD	20906-2924	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1238 Putty Hill Ave	Towson	MD	21286-5844	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3026 Festival Way	Waldorf	MD	20601-2958	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
402 B Englar Rd	Westminster	MD	21157-4852	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

### Massachusetts

Massachusetts	•			
15 Stockwell Dr Ste A	Avon	MA	02322-1172	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
251 Hartford Ave	Bellingham	MA	02019-3007	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
121 Pearl St	Braintree	MA	02184-6525	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
140 Ivory St	Braintree	MA	02184-7410	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
34 Cambridge St	Burlington	MA	01803-4674	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
37 White St	Cambridge	MA	02140-1413	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
265 Chelmsford St	Chelmsford	MA	01824-2343	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
35 Independence Way	Danvers	MA	01923-3626	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
17 Mystic View Rd	Everett	MA	02149-2428	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

325 Russell St Unit B	Hadley	MA	01035-3535	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1246 Washington St	Hanover	MA	02339-1631	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
88 Enterprise Rd	Hyannis	MA	02601-2215	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
18 Water Tower Plaza	Leominster	MA	01453-2247	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
280 School St Ste I 160	Mansfield	MA	02048-1810	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 29, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
70 Worcester Providence Tpke Ste 230	Millbury	MA	01527-2652	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1398 Worcester Rd, Unit A	Natick	MA	01760-1514	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
201 Needham St	Newton	MA	02464-1505	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1385 S Washington St	North Attleboro	MA	02760-4404	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
471 State Rd	North Dartmouth	MA	02747-4309	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
729 Bridge St	North Weymouth	MA	02191-2139	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6108 Shops Way	Northborough	MA	01532-3301	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
555 Hubbard Ave	Pittsfield	MA	01201-3810	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
211 Colony Place Rd	Plymouth	MA	02360-7237	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
607 Broadway	Saugus	MA	01906-3206	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
119 Main St, Ste 1	Stoneham	MA	02180-3305	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9 Mozzone Blvd Unit 100	Taunton	MA	02780-3795	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
137 Teaticket Hwy, Ste A-13	Teaticket	MA	02536-5659	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2421 Cranberry Hwy, Unit 204	Wareham	MA	02571-5023	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1081 Riverdale St	West Springfield	MA	01089-4614	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

Michigan

Michigan				
3220 Fairlane Dr	Allen Park	MI	48101-2871	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3655 Washtenaw Ave	Ann Arbor	MI	48104-5250	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
12765 Harper Village Dr Ste 110	Battle Creek	MI	49014-7556	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
950 E Napier Ave	Benton Harbor	MI	49022-3926	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
8389 W Grand River Ave	Brighton	MI	48116	July 5, 2013 - July 29, 2013
41904 Ford Rd	Canton	MI	48187-3647	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

51375 Gratiot Ave	Chesterfield	MI	48051-2041	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
131373 Gratiot Ave	Chesterneid	IVII	46031-2041	August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			-	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			-	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
475 H D -1	Commerce Townsh	MI	49200 2020	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
475 Haggerty Rd 30867 Orchard Lake Rd		MI	48390-3939 48334-1332	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3086/ Orchard Lake Rd	Farmington Hills	MI	48334-1332	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			-	September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
			-	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
15110 0'1 DI	Г .	M	48430-3449	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
15110 Silver Pkwy	Fenton	MI	48430-3449	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
			-	August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			-	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
22C0 CT: 1 P1	TI' 4	MI	40507 2000	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3268 S Linden Rd	Flint	MI	48507-3099	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
20.10.20.1.0.07	0 15 11		10512 1005	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3940 28th St SE	Grand Rapids	MI	49512-1806	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4830 Wilson Ave SW Ste 400	Grandville	MI	49418-3134	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3571 West Shore Dr	Holland	MI	49424-9674	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1525 Boardman Rd	Jackson	MI	49202-1973	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
540 Frandor Ave	Lansing	MI	48912-5206	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
416 N Marketplace Blvd	Lansing	MI	48917-7714	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
13110 Middlebelt Rd	Livonia	MI	48150-2231	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
32351 John R Rd	Madison Heights	MI	48071-1324	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3175 US Hwy 41 W	Marquette	MI	49855-9494	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
909 Joe Mann Blvd	Midland	MI	48642-8903	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
43635 W Oaks Dr	Novi	MI	48377-3305	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4824 S Baldwin Rd	Orion Township	MI	48359-2115	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6601 S Westnedge Ave	Portage	MI	49002-3544	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1260 S Rochester Rd	Rochester Hills	MI	48307-3120	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
32078 Gratiot Ave	Roseville	MI	48066-1140	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
	l l		1	
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3437 Tittabawassee Rd	Saginaw	MI	48604-9489	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014  May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
3437 Tittabawassee Rd	Saginaw	MI	48604-9489	•
3437 Tittabawassee Rd	Saginaw	MI	48604-9489	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013

13821 Hall Rd	Shelby Township	MI	48315-6102	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
	in the property of the propert			August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
28550 Telegraph Rd	Southfield	MI	48034-7505	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
14501 Eureka Rd	Southgate	MI	48195-2064	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3315 N US 31 S	Traverse City	MI	49684-4538	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1205 Coolidge Hwy	Troy	MI	48084-7012	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3310 Alpine Ave NW, Unit 5	Walker	MI	49544-1600	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 15, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
23460 Allen Rd	Woodhaven	MI	48183-3376	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

#### Minnesota

29, 2013 er 9, 2013 mber 23, 2013 mary 19, 2014 29, 2013 29, 2013 29, 2013 er 6, 2013
mber 23, 2013 nuary 19, 2014 29, 2013 29, 2013 29, 2013 er 6, 2013
29, 2013 29, 2013 29, 2013 29, 2013 er 6, 2013
29, 2013 29, 2013 29, 2013 er 6, 2013
29, 2013 29, 2013 er 6, 2013
29, 2013 er 6, 2013
er 6, 2013
,
mber 24, 2013
nuary 19, 2014
29, 2013
er 8, 2013
ary 18, 2013
29, 2013
29, 2013
29, 2013
29, 2013
29, 2013
29, 2013
29, 2013
st 10, 2013
ober 8, 2013
mber 23, 2013
nuary 19, 2014
29, 2013
st 11, 2013
tober 9, 2013
mber 24, 2013
nuary 19, 2014
st 10, 2013
ober 9, 2013
mber 24, 2013
nuary 19, 2014

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 64 of 108 PageID #:363

2100 N Snelling Ave	Roseville	MN	55113-6000	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8051 Old Carriage Ct	Shakopee	MN	55379-3157	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4150 W Division St	St. Cloud	MN	56301-3706	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9180 Hudson Rd	Woodbury	MN	55125-9106	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

Mississippi

1411551551551				
3942 Promenade Pkwy	D'Iberville	MS	39540-5370	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
712 Mackenzie Ln	Flowood	MS	39232-5008	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
15136 Crossroads Pkwy	Gulfport	MS	39503-3565	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4400 Hardy St	Hattiesburg	MS	39402-1309	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
175 Grandview Blvd, Ste 800	Madison	MS	39110-7595	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5030 Goodman Rd	Olive Branch	MS	38654-7905	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

### Missouri

Ballwin	MO	63011-3077	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
Blue Springs	MO	64014-2971	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
Branson	MO	65616-9940	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
Brentwood	MO	63144-1406	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
Chesterfield	MO	63005-1123	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
Columbia	MO	65203-1161	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
Des Peres	MO	63131-4502	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			October 17, 2013 - January 19, 2014
Fenton	MO	63026-4013	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
Florissant	MO	63033	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
Joplin	MO	64801-5595	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
			August 13, 2013 - October 6, 2013
			October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
Kansas City	MO	64145-1670	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
Kansas City	MO	64153-1844	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
			December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
Kansas City	MO	64157-1227	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
Lee's Summit	MO	64081-3934	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
O'Fallon	MO	63368-7929	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
	Blue Springs Branson  Brentwood Chesterfield Columbia Des Peres  Fenton  Florissant Joplin  Kansas City  Kansas City  Lee's Summit	Blue Springs MO Branson MO  Brentwood MO Chesterfield MO Columbia MO Des Peres MO  Fenton MO  Florissant MO Joplin MO  Kansas City MO  Kansas City MO Lee's Summit MO	Blue Springs   MO   64014-2971     Branson   MO   65616-9940     Brentwood   MO   63144-1406     Chesterfield   MO   63005-1123     Columbia   MO   65203-1161     Des Peres   MO   63131-4502     Fenton   MO   63026-4013     Florissant   MO   63033     Joplin   MO   64801-5595     Kansas City   MO   64153-1844     Kansas City   MO   64157-1227     Lee's Summit   MO   64081-3934

## Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 65 of 108 PageID #:364 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

1840 E Independence St	Springfield	MO	65804-3754	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2155 Zumbehl Rd	St. Charles	MO	63303-2724	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5201 N Belt Hwy Ste 125	St. Joseph	MO	64506-1256	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5796 S Lindbergh Blvd	St. Louis	MO	63123-6937	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2094 Washington Crossing	Washington	MO	63090-5284	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1856 Wentzville Pkwy	Wentzville	MO	63385-3817	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

#### Montana

1.101100110				
2800 King Ave W Ste C	Billings	MT	59102-6432	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2855 N 19th Ave Ste B	Bozeman	MT	59718-8504	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1601 Market Place Dr Ste 25	Great Falls	MT	59404-3482	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2850 N Reserve St	Missoula	MT	59808-1318	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

### Nebraska

10521 S 15th St	Bellevue	NE	68123-4085	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3010 Pine Lake Rd Ste A	Lincoln	NE	68516-6018	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
12404 K Plaza	Omaha	NE	68137-2249	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3405 N 147th St	Omaha	NE	68116-8189	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

#### Nevada

nevaua				
911 Topsy Ln Ste 112	Carson City	NV	89705-8402	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 20, 2014
537 N Stephanie St	Henderson	NV	89014-6613	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
9881 S Eastern Ave	Las Vegas	NV	89183-6949	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7941 W Tropical Pkwy	Las Vegas	NV	89149-4534	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7195 Arroyo Crossing Pkwy	Las Vegas	NV	89113-4057	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7321 W Lake Mead Blvd	Las Vegas	NV	89128-1003	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1251 S Decatur Blvd	Las Vegas	NV	89102-5515	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 66 of 108 PageID #:365 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

6990 N 5th St	North Las Vegas	NV	89084-1351	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4871 Kietzke Ln	Reno	NV	89509-6549	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
165 Los Altos Pkwy	Sparks	NV	89436-7712	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

**New Hampshire** 

11CW Hampsinic	1			
123 Rte 101a	Amherst	NH	03031-2246	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
86 D'Amante Dr	Concord	NH	03301-5759	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
11 Brickyard Square, Ste 19	Epping	NH	03042-4405	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - January 19, 2014
7 Ash Brook Rd	Keene	NH	03431-5918	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1111 S Willow St Unit 3	Manchester	NH	03103-4035	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
45 Gosling Rd	Newington	NH	03801-2802	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
290 S Broadway Ste 2	Salem	NH	03079-3323	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

New Jersey

New Jersey				
321 Bayonne Crossing Way	Bayonne	NJ	07002-5304	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
135 Promenade Blvd	Bridgewater	NJ	08807-3455	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
348 State Rt 3 W	Clifton	NJ	07014-1900	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
410 State Rte 10	East Hanover	NJ	07936-3552	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
178 Rte 35 S	Eatontown	NJ	07724-1883	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
465 River Rd	Edgewater	NJ	07020-1145	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
30 International Dr Ste J	Flanders	NJ	07836-4107	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
325 Hwy 202	Flemington	NJ	08822-1730	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4331 Route 9	Freehold	NJ	07728-4215	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2130 State Route 35	Holmdel	NJ	07733-2770	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			[	October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

4785 Rte 9 N	Howell	NJ	07731-3385	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
240 Consumer Square	Mays Landing	NJ	08330-3325	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1199 Nixon Dr	Moorestown	NJ	08057-3201	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
869 Route 1	North Brunswick	NJ	08902-3345	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
240 N State Rt 17	Paramus	NJ	07652-2925	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1099 Rte 46 E	Parsippany	NJ	07054-2177	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1206 New Brunswick Ave	Phillipsburg	NJ	08865-4124	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
300 Nassau Park Blvd	Princeton	NJ	08540-5940	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
75 Interstate Shopping Center	Ramsey	NJ	07446-1605	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3201 Route 9 S	Rio Grande	NJ	08242-1006	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
327 Mount Hope Ave	Rockaway Townsh	NJ	07866-1645	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
463 Cross Keys Rd	Sicklerville	NJ	08081-9749	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
601 Washington Ave Ste K	Stafford Township	NJ	08050-2800	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1342 Hooper Ave	Toms River	NJ	08753-2855	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
320 Marketplace Blvd	Trenton	NJ	08691-2107	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3849 S Delsea Dr Ste A3	Vineland	NJ	08360-7408	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1701 US Hwy 22 Ste 65	Watchung	NJ	07069-6500	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1660 Rte 23	Wayne	NJ	07470-7516	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2000 Clements Bridge Rd	West Deptford	NJ	08096-2011	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

#### New Mexico

TYEW IVIENICO				
4410 Wyoming Blvd NE	Albuquerque	NM	87111-3165	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3701 Ellison Dr NW Ste B	Albuquerque	NM	87114-7016	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3549 Zafarano Dr	Santa Fe	NM	87507-2618	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

### New York

161 Washington Ave Ext Ste 8	Albany	NY	12205-5600	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1261 Niagara Falls Blvd	Amherst	NY	14226-1104	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

240 Amsterdam Commons	Amsterdam	NY	12010	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4210 Veterans Memorial Dr	Batavia	NY	14020-1254	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
832 Sunrise Hwy	Bay Shore	NY	11706-5906	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
332 Sumise Hwy	Day Shore	111	11700-3700	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
100-B Independent Way	Brewster	NY	10509-2368	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
320 Eastern Blvd	Canandaigua	NY	14424	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
320 Lasterii Bivu	Canandargua	111	14424	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
27 Centre Dr	Central Valley	NY	10917-6501	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
27 Centre Di	Central variey	111	10717-0301	August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - November 24, 2013
1740 Walden Ave Ste 200	Cheektowaga	NY	14225-4925	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5055 Transit Rd	Clarence	NY	14221-4132	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
48 Crossing Blvd	Clifton Park	NY	12065-4180	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
50 Veterans Memorial Hwy	Commack	NY	11725-3409	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
30 Veteralis Memoriai Hwy	Commack	IN I	11725-5409	October 16, 2013 - January 19, 2014
845 County Rte 64	Elmira	NY	14903-7900	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
843 County Rte 04	Ellilla	IN I	14905-7900	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
18704 Horace Harding Expy	Fresh Meadows	NY	11365-2716	May 17, 2013 - July 29, 2013
319 N Central Ave	Hartsdale	NY	10530-1811	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
350 Walt Whitman Rd	Huntington Station		11746-8704	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
330 Wait William Ku	nulllington Station	IN I	11/40-6/04	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
C14 C M 1 C4 C4 - 200	T41	NIXZ	14050 5210	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
614 S Meadow St Ste 300 703 Frank Sottile Blvd	Ithaca	NY	14850-5319	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
703 Frank Sottile Blvd	Kingston	NY	12401-1552	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013 August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
279 E Fairmount Ave Ste I	Lakewood	NIXZ	14750-1900	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014 May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
579 Troy-Schenectady Rd		NY	12110-2806	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
1379 Troy-Schenectady Rd	Latham	NY	12110-2800	
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
2675 Hammata d Tula	Levittown	NY	11756-1403	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3675 Hempstead Tpke	Levittown	ΝY	11/56-1403	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
1250 N. d. DI 1	26.1	N13.7	11020 2004	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1350 Northern Blvd	Manhasset	NY	11030-3004	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
	2.6		11550 5200	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5500 Sunrise Hwy	Massapequa	NY	11758-5399	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2799 Route 112	Medford	NY	11763-2535	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
88-5 Dunning Rd	Middletown	NY	10940-2218	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3117 E Main St	Mohegan Lake	NY	10547-1521	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4745 Commercial Dr	New Hartford	NY	13413-6211	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
808 Columbus Ave	New York	NY	10025-5139	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

1245 Rte 300 Ste 1	Newburgh	NY	12550-5007	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
1243 Rte 300 Ste 1	Newburgh	INI	12330-3007	August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
337 Northern Lights Plaza	North Syracuse	NY	13212-4130	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3610 Long Beach Rd	Oceanside		11572-5705	
499 Sunrise Hwy W Ste 65		NY NY	11772-2200	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
499 Sumse Hwy W Ste 63	Patchogue	NI	11//2-2200	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
0.40 D-11 Di	D-11 M	NIX/	10002 2710	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
840 Pelham Pkwy	Pelham Manor	NY	10803-2710	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
71 Consumer Sq	Plattsburgh	NY	12901-6532	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
27 Waterfront Pl (Don Bosco Pl)	Port Chester	NY	10573-6001	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2522 South Rd	Poughkeepsie	NY	12601-5468	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
9030 Metropolitan Ave	Rego Park	NY	11374-5328	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1440 Old Country Rd Ste 400	Riverhead	NY	11901-2040	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3349 Monroe Ave	Rochester	NY	14618-5513	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
300 Hylan Dr	Rochester	NY	14623-4216	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
500 Greece Ridge Center Dr	Rochester	NY	14626-2823	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
346-40 Route 25A	Rocky Point	NY	11778-8817	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
14 A Spring Valley Marketplace	Spring Valley	NY	10977-5209	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
30 Barrett Ave	Staten Island	NY	10302-2046	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			1	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2795 Richmond Ave	Staten Island	NY	10314-5857	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			l	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
			•	
2130 Nesconset Hwv	Stony Brook	NY	11790-3503	•
2130 Nesconset Hwy	Stony Brook	NY NY	11790-3503 13214-1201	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2130 Nesconset Hwy 3133 Erie Blvd E	Stony Brook Syracuse	NY NY	11790-3503 13214-1201	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013 August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013 August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
3133 Erie Blvd E	Syracuse	NY	13214-1201	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013 August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
				May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013  August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013  October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014  May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
3133 Erie Blvd E	Syracuse	NY	13214-1201	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013 August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 70 of 108 PageID #:369 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

2317 Vestal Pwy E Ste 10	Vestal	NY	13850-1948	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
40 Square Dr	Victor	NY	14564-1051	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
21839 Towne Center Dr	Watertown	NY	13601-5898	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1280 Corporate Dr	Westbury	NY	11590-6625	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5106 Northern Blvd	Woodside	NY	11377-1733	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

## North Carolina

North Carolina				
5 McKenna Rd	Arden	NC	28704-9201	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
111-A River Hills Rd	Asheville	NC	28805-2550	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
320 Watauga Village Dr	Boone	NC	28607-5263	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1455 University Dr	Burlington	NC	27215-8768	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
340 Crossroads Blvd	Cary	NC	27518-6895	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8716 JW Clay Blvd	Charlotte	NC	28262-8471	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7836 Rea Road	Charlotte	NC	28277-6502	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4337 Park Rd	Charlotte	NC	28209-2233	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
8120 Providence Rd	Charlotte	NC	28277-9750	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
5442 New Hope Common Dr	Durham	NC	27707-9716	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8200 Renaissance Pkwy Ste 1030	Durham	NC	27713-6688	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2057 Skibo Rd	Fayetteville	NC	28314-2207	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
270 Shenstone Ln	Garner	NC	27529-6905	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2904 E Franklin Blvd	Gastonia	NC	28056-9469	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
401 N Berkeley Blvd	Goldsboro	NC	27534-4327	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
1206 Bridford Pkwy Ste C	Greensboro	NC	27407-2744	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1616 Highwoods Blvd	Greensboro	NC	27410-2048	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
600 SE Greenville Blvd Ste F	Greenville	NC	27858-6737	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2195 US Hwy 70 SE	Hickory	NC	28602-5163	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

164 Grand Hill Place	Holly Springs	NC	27540	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1250 Western Blvd Ste J	Jacksonville	NC	28546-6653	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1006 Shoppes at Midway Dr	Knightdale	NC	27545-7313	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
10510 Northeast Pkwy	Matthews	NC	28105-6708	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
590 River Hwy Ste H	Mooresville	NC	28117-8840	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
5160 Hwy 70 W Ste 400	Morehead City	NC	28557-4546	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3028 Dr Martin Luther King Jr Blvd	New Bern	NC	28562-5212	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5240 Capital Blvd	Raleigh	NC	27616-2924	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8131 Brier Creek Pkwy	Raleigh	NC	27617-7598	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1251 Cobb Corners Dr	Rocky Mount	NC	27804-2530	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - January 18, 2014
10205 US 15/501 Unit #39	Southern Pines	NC	28387-5110	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 19, 2014
216 Turnersburg Hwy	Statesville	NC	28625-2797	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
305 Town Center Loop	Waynesville	NC	28786-6872	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6881 Monument Dr	Wilmington	NC	28405-4178	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1050 Hanes Mall Blvd	Winston-Salem	NC	27103-1309	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

#### North Dakota

1 tol til Dakota				
3861 32nd Ave S	Grand Forks	ND	58201-5907	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1638 13th Ave E Ste 1	West Fargo	ND	58078-3404	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

## Ohio

7405 Market Place Dr	Aurora	OH	44202-8760	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
35840 Detroit Rd	Avon	OH	44011-1655	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
24081 Chagrin Blvd	Beachwood	OH	44122-5512	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 72 of 108 PageID #:371 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

2500 N Fairfield Rd	Beavercreek	ОН	45431-1781	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
365 Boardman-Canfield Rd	Boardman	OH	44512-4702	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4798 Ridge Rd Ste A	Brooklyn	ОН	44144-3327	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
č				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
9657 Colerain Ave	Cincinnati	ОН	45251-2003	July 12, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9851 Waterstone Blvd	Cincinnati	ОН	45249-8296	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
700 Eastgate S Dr Ste 100A	Cincinnati	ОН	45245-1583	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3862 Paxton Ave	Cincinnati	ОН	45209-2399	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
425 E Kemper Rd	Cincinnati	ОН	45246-3228	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6030 Glenway Ave	Cincinnati	ОН	45211-6318	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
90 Graceland Blvd	Columbus	ОН	43214-7509	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
3680 Easton Market	Columbus	ОН	43219-6032	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
3612 W Dublin Granville Rd	Columbus	ОН	43235-4901	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
697 Howe Ave	Cuyahoga Falls	ОН	44221-4955	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3750 W Market St Unit Y	Fairlawn	ОН	44333-4803	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1614 Stringtown Rd	Grove City	ОН	43123-8995	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3455 Princeton Rd	Hamilton	ОН	45011-7956	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
685 Hebron Rd	Heath	ОН	43056-1351	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1830 Hilliard Rome Rd	Hilliard	ОН	43026-7565	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9051 Columbus Pike	Lewis Center	ОН	43035-9412	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1361 SOM Center Rd	Mayfield Heights	ОН	44124-2103	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7900 Plaza Blvd Ste 140	Mentor	ОН	44060-5521	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 20, 2014
8111 Springboro Pike	Miamisburg	ОН	45342-3703	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5555 Youngstown Warren Rd Ste 975	Niles	ОН	44446-4804	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6527 Strip Ave NW	North Canton	ОН	44720-7095	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2766 Brice Rd	Reynoldsburg	ОН	43068-3419	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
<u> </u>	•	•	•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 73 of 108 PageID #:372 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

9860 Old E US 20	Rossford	ОН	43460-1721	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5255 Airport Hwy	Toledo	OH	43615-6800	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4622 Talmadge Rd	Toledo	OH	43623-3007	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7624 Voice of America Centre Dr	West Chester	OH	45069-2794	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 15, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

### Oklahoma

Omminu				
520 Ed Noble Pkwy	Norman	OK	73072-4875	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 20, 2014
1441 W I-240 Service Rd	Oklahoma City	OK	73159-4145	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5012 N May Ave	Oklahoma City	OK	73112-6010	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2200 W Memorial Rd	Oklahoma City	OK	73134-8010	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
11119 E 71st St S	Tulsa	OK	74133-2550	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7424 S Olympia Ave	Tulsa	OK	74132-1838	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4927 E 41st St	Tulsa	OK	74135-6057	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

Oregon

18069 NW Evergreen Pkwy	Beaverton	OR	97006-7440	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4955 SW Western Ave	Beaverton	OR	97005-3429	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
63485 N Hwy 97	Bend	OR	97701-8492	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
11211 SE 82nd Ave Ste F	Clackamas	OR	97086-7624	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1550 NW 9th St, Ste 106	Corvallis	OR	97330-4513	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2101 NE Burnside St Ste 20	Gresham	OR	97030-7944	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
6445 Keizer Station Blvd NE	Keizer	OR	97303-1695	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 74 of 108 PageID #:373 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

1920 Austin St	Klamath Falls	OR	97603-4644	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3475 Crater Lake Hwy	Medford	OR	97504-9259	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1900 McLoughlin Blvd Ste 90	Oregon City	OR	97045-1072	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
11719 NE Glenn Widing Dr	Portland	OR	97220-9051	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
12255 N Starlight Ave	Portland	OR	97217-7845	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
780 NW Garden Valley Blvd Ste 170	Roseburg	OR	97470-6515	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3318 Gateway St	Springfield	OR	97477-1054	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7705 SW Nyberg St	Tualatin	OR	97062-8443	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

Pennsylvania

Pennsylvania				
189 Falon Ln	Altoona	PA	16602-6541	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			1	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
57 E City Ave	Bala Cynwyd	PA	19004-2421	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				November 15, 2013 - December 23, 2013
4000 Oxford Dr	Bethel Park	PA	15102-1840	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
740 Butler Crossing	Butler	PA	16001-2439	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3415 Simpson Ferry Rd Ste 1	Camp Hill	PA	17011-6404	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			[	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
230 Westminster Dr	Carlisle	PA	17013-3117	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			[	August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			[	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
967 Norland Ave	Chambersburg	PA	17201-4204	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
300 Water Loop Dr Ste 4	Collegeville	PA	19426-4917	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			l	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
104 Allan Wood Dr	Conshohocken	PA	19428-1135	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
20111 Rt 19	Cranberry Townshi	PA	16066-6207	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			[	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1150 Commerce Blvd	Dickson City	PA	18519-1688	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4447 Southmont Way	Easton	PA	18045-4705	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2088 C Interchange Rd	Erie	PA	16565-1108	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
-			1	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			1	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
285 Main St	Exton	PA	19341-3701	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
751 Bustleton Pike	Feasterville Trevos	PA	19053-6055	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5280 Route 30 Ste 6	Greensburg	PA	15601-7832	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			l l	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			1	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 75 of 108 PageID #:374 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

5125 Jonestown Rd Ste 445	Harrisburg	PA	17112-2924	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
5125 Johestown Rd Ste 445	namsburg	PA	1/112-2924	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
475 Ben Franklin Rd S Ste 24	Indiana	DA	15701-2347	
4/5 Ben Franklin Rd S Ste 24	Indiana	PA	15/01-234/	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			-	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
420 T. G. ( D.	T 1 4	D.A	15004 2056	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
420 Town Centre Dr	Johnstown	PA	15904-2856	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
200 W DeKalb Pike	King of Prussia	PA	19406-2327	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1645 Lititz Pike	Lancaster	PA	17601-6507	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2424 E Lincoln Hwy	Langhorne	PA	19047-3048	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1127 Quentin Rd	Lebanon	PA	17042-6915	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
115 Wagner Rd, Bldg B	Monaca	PA	15061-2457	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3759 William Penn Hwy	Monroeville	PA	15146-2125	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
270 S Lycoming Mall Rd	Muncy	PA	17756-8063	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
660 Waterfront Dr E	Munhall	PA	15120-5000	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
			ľ	August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
			l †	October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
			l †	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1231 Knapp Rd	North Wales	PA	19454-1831	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
9739 Roosevelt Blvd	Philadelphia	PA	19114-1010	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4801 McKnight Rd	Pittsburgh	PA	15237-3412	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
			l	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
700 Settlers Ridge Center Dr	Pittsburgh	PA	15205-1436	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1122 Town Square Rd Ste 12	Pottstown	PA	19465-1017	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
1122 Town Square Ru Ste 12	1 ottstown	171	15105 1017	October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
7110 Fairlane Village Mall, Ste B	Pottsville	PA	17901-4100	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
7110 Fairfaile Village Mail, Ste B	Tousvine	IA	1/901-4100	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - November 24, 2013
232 N West End Blvd	Ovalrantarya	DA	18951-2308	·
232 N West End Blvd	Quakertown	PA	18951-2308	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
250 Maniartalana Di 1	C -1:	D.A	17070 2402	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
250 Marketplace Blvd	Selinsgrove	PA	17870-2402	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
CO1 H/ D 1/1	G : 0:11	F.	10054 2015	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
601 W Baltimore Pike	Springfield	PA	19064-3812	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
44 Colonnade Way	State College	PA	16803-2309	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
125 Radio Way	Stroudsburg	PA	18360-7911	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1030 Village Center Dr	Tarentum	PA	15084-3847	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 76 of 108 PageID #:375 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

1055 Main St	Warrington	PA	18976-2488	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
339 Washington Rd	Washington	PA	15301-2701	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
276 Susquehanna Blvd	West Hazleton	PA	18202-1137	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1911 Whitehall Mall	Whitehall	PA	18052-5119	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
485 Arena Hub Plaza	Wilkes Barre	PA	18702-6839	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 29, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2534 W Moreland Rd	Willow Grove	PA	19090-4001	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2763 Papermill Rd	Wyomissing	PA	19610-3328	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2700 Pleasant Valley Rd	York	PA	17402-9609	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

#### **Rhode Island**

Ithour Island				
1305 W Main Rd	Middletown	RI	02842-6355	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
240 Smithfield Crossing	Smithfield	RI	02917-2402	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
1500 Bald Hill Rd Unit C	Warwick	RI	02886-4259	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
15 Airport Rd	Westerly	RI	02891	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

### **South Carolina**

South Caronna				
3521 Clemson Blvd	Anderson	SC	29621-1312	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
30 Malphrus Rd Ste 107	Bluffton	SC	29910-6635	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
10204 Two Notch Rd Ste 2	Columbia	SC	29229-4386	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
244 Harbison Blvd	Columbia	SC	29212-2232	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
20 Haywood Rd	Greenville	SC	29607-3826	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
420 Hwy 72 Byp, Ste 39A	Greenwood	SC	29649-1407	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1501 N Hwy 17 Unit A	Mt. Pleasant	SC	29464-3342	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 77 of 108 PageID #:376 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

554 Seaboard St	Myrtle Beach	SC	29577-9732	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
7620 N Rivers Ave Ste 130	North Charleston	SC	29406-4012	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
546 John Ross Pkwy	Rock Hill	SC	29730-8910	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013
				August 29, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
120 Dorman Centre Dr Ste I	Spartanburg	SC	29301-2625	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1267 Broad St	Sumter	SC	29150-1973	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

### **South Dakota**

1707 Eglin St	Rapid City	SD	57701-6100	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3801 W 34th St Ste 103	Sioux Falls	SD	57106-4310	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

#### Tennessee

Telliessee	1.1		25504 22 33	N. 0.0010 V.1.00.0015
111 Hamilton Crossing Dr	Alcoa	TN	37701-2263	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
8105 Moores Ln Ste 1700	Brentwood	TN	37027-2973	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2200 Hamilton Place Blvd	Chattanooga	TN	37421-6015	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4550 Frontage Rd NW	Cleveland	TN	37312-2905	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3621 S Houston Levee Rd	Collierville	TN	38017-9014	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3211 Peoples St Sp B	Johnson City	TN	37604-4108	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2626 E Stone Dr Ste 110	Kingsport	TN	37660-5848	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9622 Kingston Pike	Knoxville	TN	37922-2387	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2215 N Gallatin Pike Rd	Madison	TN	37115-2005	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
8035 Giacosa Place	Memphis	TN	38133-5301	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 78 of 108 PageID #:377 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

851 S White Station Rd	Memphis	TN	38117-5702	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2615 Medical Center Pkwy, Ste 400	Murfreesboro	TN	37129-2257	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
719 Thompson Ln	Nashville	TN	37204-3624	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7657 Hwy 70 S Ste 114	Nashville	TN	37221-1706	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

Texas				
3433 Catclaw Dr	Abilene	TX	79606-8223	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2203 S Western St, Ste 600	Amarillo	TX	79109	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1108 W Arbrook Blvd	Arlington	TX	76015-4211	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
130 Lincoln Square	Arlington	TX	76011	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
14028 N Hwy 183, Bldg C	Austin	TX	78717-5903	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5601 Brodie Ln Ste 200	Austin	TX	78745-2512	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
10225 Research Blvd Ste 2000	Austin	TX	78759-5743	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3201 Bee Caves Rd Ste 112	Austin	TX	78746-6696	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6614 Garth Rd	Baytown	TX	77521-8623	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4450 N Dowlen Rd	Beaumont	TX	77706-6702	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4150 N Dowlen Rd	Beaumont	TX	77706-6851	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
12770 Shops Pkwy Ste 100	Bee Caves	TX	78738-6318	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
571 E Morrison Rd	Brownsville	TX	78526-3370	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1151 N Burleson Blvd	Burleson	TX	76028-7009	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
751 N US Hwy 67	Cedar Hill	TX	75104-2142	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1505 E University Dr Ste 300	College Station	TX	77840-2672	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2218 I-45 N	Conroe	TX	77301-1051	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4717-E S Padre Island Dr	Corpus Christi	TX	78411-4415	May 8, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
25715 Northwest Fwy	Cypress	TX	77429-1047	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

5301 S Beltline Rd, Ste 101	Dallas	TX	75254-7664	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
3301 S Bellille Ru, Ste 101	Dallas	111	73234-7004	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
5500 C	D-11	TV	75207 2021	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
5500 Greenville Ave Ste 700	Dallas	TX	75206-2931	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1800 S Loop 288 Ste 106	Denton	TX	76205-4803	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1821 Gulf Fwy	Dickinson	TX	77539-3207	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1313 George Dieter Ste C	El Paso	TX	79936-7410	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 15, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
811 Sunland Park Dr	El Paso	TX	79912-5147	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
359 Carroll St	Fort Worth	TX	76107-1959	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4921 Overton Ridge Blvd	Fort Worth	TX	76132-1910	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5325 N Garland Ave	Garland	TX	75040-2716	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1013 W University Ave Ste 600	Georgetown	TX	78628-5332	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
1				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			1	December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3906 US Hwy 377, Ste 114	Granbury	TX	76048-5428	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3904 Bissonnet St	Houston	TX	77005-1143	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6823 Hwy 6 N	Houston	TX	77084-1315	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7560 Westheimer Rd Unit A	Houston	TX	77063-4615	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9666 Old Katy Rd	Houston	TX	77055-6322	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
5000 Old Raty Rd	Houston	171	77033 0322	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
			l	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2650 Eldridge Pkwy	Houston	TX	77082-6874	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7630 FM 1960 W	Houston	TX	77070-5721	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
19653 US Hwy 59	Humble	TX	77338-3565	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
19633 US HWY 39	Hullible	11	11338-3303	
846 Northeast Mall Dr	Hurst	TX	76053-4653	October 17, 2013 - January 19, 2014
846 Northeast Mail Dr	Hurst	11	/0033-4033	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
5.605 N.N. A. d. Di. d.	T .	(D) (	75062 7512	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7635 N MacArthur Blvd	Irving	TX	75063-7513	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 29, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
23514 Westheimer Pkwy	Katy	TX	77494-3587	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2005 S Main St	Keller	TX	76248-5122	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5510 San Bernardo Ave	Laredo	TX	78041-3008	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2325 S Stemmons Frwy Ste 402	Lewisville	TX	75067-2312	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
1				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
			l	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
422 W Loop 281 Ste 500	Longview	TX	75605-4455	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
1422 W Loop 201 Stc 300	Longview	121	75005 4455	August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
			j	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
6705 Slide Rd	Lubbook	TV	79424-1513	·
	Lubbock	TX		May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2041 N Hwy 287 Ste 501	Mansfield	TX	76063-8847	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
520 E Expy 83	McAllen	TX	78503-1615	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

1751 N Central Expy Bldg B	McKinney	TX	75070-3113	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
1731 N Central Expy Blug B	Wickinney	1.7	75070-3113	August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
19105 LBJ Fwy	Mesquite	TX	75150-6416	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
19103 EBJ I wy	Wiesquite	IA	73130-0410	October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3001 W Loop 250 N	Midland	TX	79705-3252	May 8, 2013 - January 19, 2014
209 E FM 544	Murphy	TX	75094-4023	May 8, 2013 - January 19, 2014  May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
209 E PM 344	With	11	73034-4023	August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
3827 E 42nd St	Odessa	TX	79762-5947	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5730 Fairmont Pkwy	Pasadena	TX	77505-3906	
3127 Silverlake Village Dr			77584-8082	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3127 Silveriake Village Dr	Pearland	TX	//384-8082	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
0700 D ( D10, 107	DI	TP37	75004 2201	December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
8700 Preston Rd Ste 107	Plano	TX	75024-3321	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6400 W Plano Pkwy Ste 130	Plano	TX	75093-8207	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
201777171 2 2				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
801 W 15th St Ste A	Plano	TX	75075-8838	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2717 Market Center Dr	Rockwall	TX	75032-6564	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
23701 Brazos Town Crossing	Rosenberg	TX	77471-6333	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3021 S IH-35 Ste 190	Round Rock	TX	78664-8300	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4451 Sunset Dr	San Angelo	TX	76901-5612	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 15, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
17700 San Pedro Ave, Ste 400	San Antonio	TX	78232-1414	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
255 E Basse Rd Ste 120	San Antonio	TX	78209-8336	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
17802 La Cantera Pkwy Ste 104	San Antonio	TX	78257-8206	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
5347 W Loop 1604 N, Ste 103	San Antonio	TX	78253-5794	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6065 NW Loop 410	San Antonio	TX	78238-3339	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
8340 Agora Pkwy	Selma	TX	78154-1326	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
2901 E Hwy 114 Ste 100	Southlake	TX	76092-6694	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
20626 I-45 N	Spring	TX	77373-2925	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
15385 Southwest Fwy	Sugarland	TX	77478-3832	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 19, 2014

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 81 of 108 PageID #:380 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

3550 S General Bruce Dr Ste A120	Temple	TX	76504-5133	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3401 Mall Dr	Texarkana	TX	75503-2475	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4402 S Broadway Ave	Tyler	TX	75703-1303	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
521 N Valley Mills Dr	Waco	TX	76710-5234	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
225 Adams Dr Ste 225	Weatherford	TX	76086-6724	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1019 W Bay Area Blvd	Webster	TX	77598-4047	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3201 Lawrence Rd Ste 150	Wichita Falls	TX	76308-1633	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
19075 IH-45 S Ste 104	The Woodlands	TX	77385-8748	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

#### Utah

American Fork   UT   84003-2473   June 14, 2013 - August 10, 2013   August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013   October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013   December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014					
December 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	45 N Meadow Ln	American Fork	UT	84003-2473	June 14, 2013 - August 10, 2013
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014					August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
Bountiful					October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013					December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014	20 S 500 W Ste 0113	Bountiful	UT	84010-7112	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
Draper   UT   84020-8185   May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013					October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
1804 N Woodland Park Dr         Layton         UT         84041-5639         May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013           1427-B N Main St         Logan         UT         84341-2223         May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013           August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013         October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013           December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014           1128 E Ft Union Blvd         Midvale         UT         84047-1804         May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013           October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013         October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013         December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014           321 E 1300 S         Orem         UT         84058-5424         May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013           6400 N Hwy 224, Unit B         Park City         UT         84098-5955         May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013           September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013					December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1427-B N Main St       Logan       UT       84341-2223       May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013         August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013       October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013         December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014         1128 E Ft Union Blvd       Midvale       UT       84047-1804       May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013         October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013       October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013         December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014         321 E 1300 S       Orem       UT       84058-5424       May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013         6400 N Hwy 224, Unit B       Park City       UT       84098-5955       May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013         September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013		Draper	UT	84020-8185	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014  1128 E Ft Union Blvd Midvale UT 84047-1804 May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013 December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  321 E 1300 S Orem UT 84058-5424 May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013 6400 N Hwy 224, Unit B Park City UT 84098-5955 May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013 September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013	304 N Woodland Park Dr	Layton	UT	84041-5639	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	427-B N Main St	Logan	UT	84341-2223	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014					August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
Midvale     UT     84047-1804     May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013       October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013     October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013       December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014       321 E 1300 S     Orem     UT     84058-5424     May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013       6400 N Hwy 224, Unit B     Park City     UT     84098-5955     May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013       September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013					October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013  December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014  321 E 1300 S Orem UT 84058-5424 May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013  6400 N Hwy 224, Unit B Park City UT 84098-5955 May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013 September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013					December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014	128 E Ft Union Blvd	Midvale	UT	84047-1804	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
321 E 1300 S         Orem         UT         84058-5424         May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013           6400 N Hwy 224, Unit B         Park City         UT         84098-5955         May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013           September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013					October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
6400 N Hwy 224, Unit B Park City UT 84098-5955 May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013 September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013					December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013	21 E 1300 S	Orem	UT	84058-5424	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
	400 N Hwy 224, Unit B	Park City	UT	84098-5955	
November 13, 2013 - January 18, 2014					September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
4125 Riverdale Rd Riverdale UT 84405-3509 May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013	125 Riverdale Rd	Riverdale	UT	84405-3509	
August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013					<u> </u>
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013					October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014					December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2236 S 1300 St E Ste D-2 Salt Lake City UT 84106-2803 May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013	236 S 1300 St E Ste D-2	Salt Lake City	UT	84106-2803	·
August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013					August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013					October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014					December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
313 S River Rd St. George UT 84790-2118 May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	13 S River Rd	St. George	UT	84790-2118	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
7668 S Campus View Dr West Jordan UT 84084-4316 May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	568 S Campus View Dr	West Jordan	UT	84084-4316	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3061 S 5600 W West Valley City UT 84120-1303 May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013	061 S 5600 W	West Valley City	UT	84120-1303	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013					<u> </u>
October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013					October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014					December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

# Vermont

324 S Main St (US Route 7 S)	Rutland	VT	05701-4925	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
861 Williston Rd Ste 1	South Burlington	VT	05403-5724	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 15, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

Virginia				
7690A Richmond Hwy	Alexandria	VA	22306-2843	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
•				August 12, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1035 Emmet St N	Charlottesville	VA	22903-4834	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1593 Crossways Blvd	Chesapeake	VA	23320-2442	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
·	•			October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4300 Portsmouth Blvd Ste 270	Chesapeake	VA	23321-2156	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
140 Conston Ave	Christiansburg	VA	24073-1151	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
90 Southgate Square	Colonial Heights	VA	23834-3611	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
3089A Nutley St	Fairfax	VA	22031-1968	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
•				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
13061 Fair Lakes Shopping Ctr Ste 100	Fairfax	VA	22033-5179	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
6330 Seven Corners Ctr	Falls Church	VA	22044-2409	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3102 Plank Rd, Ste 299	Fredericksburg	VA	22407-1125	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
			Ι	October 16, 2013 - January 18, 2013
8171 Stonewall Shops Sq	Gainesville	VA	20155-3891	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
9856 W Broad St	Glen Allen	VA	23060-4171	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
9910 Brook Rd	Glen Allen	VA	23059-6501	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2170 Coliseum Dr Ste C	Hampton	VA	23666-5985	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
277 Burgess Rd	Harrisonburg	VA	22801-3718	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4531 S Laburnum Ave Ste 700	Henrico	VA	23231-2481	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
		<u> </u>		December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1019 A - Edwards Ferry Rd NE	Leesburg	VA	20176-3347	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4026 G Wards Rd	Lynchburg	VA	24502-2944	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
10828 Sudley Manor Dr	Manassas	VA	20109-2834	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

11607 Midlothian Tpke	Midlothian	VA	23113-2620	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4700 Commonwealth Centre Pkwy	Midlothian	VA	23112-2640	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
315 Chatham Dr	Newport News	VA	23602-4382	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
11630 Plaza America Dr	Reston	VA	20190-4700	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1357 Town Square Blvd NW	Roanoke	VA	24012-1611	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
6717 Spring Mall Dr	Springfield	VA	22150-1907	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1110 Stafford Market Place	Stafford	VA	22556-4524	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
46301 Potomac Run Plaza Unit 180	Sterling	VA	20164-6614	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
311 Maple Ave E	Vienna	VA	22180-4717	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
737 First Colonial Rd Ste 107	Virginia Beach	VA	23451-6123	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1169 Nimmo Pkwy Ste 222	Virginia Beach	VA	23456-7730	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
304 Constitution Dr	Virginia Beach	VA	23462-3102	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
821 Town Center Dr Ste F	Waynesboro	VA	22980-9262	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
5225 Settlers Market Blvd #110	Williamsburg	VA	23185	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
2540 S Pleasant Valley Rd	Winchester	VA	22601-7010	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
14137 Crossing Pl	Woodbridge	VA	22192-4687	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014

Washington

, , tipining to 11				
15600 NE 8th St Ste D-4	Bellevue	WA	98008-3917	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4383 Meridian St	Bellingham	WA	98226-7624	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1567 S Burlington Blvd	Burlington	WA	98233-3219	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013
1441 NW Louisiana Ave	Chehalis	WA	98532-1749	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
1325B SE Everett Mall Way	Everett	WA	98208-2808	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 12, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
32061 Pacific Hwy S	Federal Way	WA	98003-6001	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
4919 Point Fosdick Dr NW	Gig Harbor	WA	98335-1843	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1802 12th Ave NW Ste A	Issaquah	WA	98027-8934	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
6803 W Canal Dr	Kennewick	WA	99336-7673	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

9755 Juanita Dr NE	Kirkland	WA	98034-4201	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
701 Sleater Kinney Rd SE Ste 25	Lacey	WA	98503-1133	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
,				September 1, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
5730 Lakewood Towne Center Blvd SW	Lakewood	WA	98499-3895	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
200 Triangle Center Ste 240	Longview	WA	98632-4679	May 8, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
3115 Alderwood Mall Blvd	Lynnwood	WA	98036-4719	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
16418 Twin Lakes Ave	Marysville	WA	98271-4717	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
	•			August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
4621 S Meridian St Ste A905	Puyallup	WA	98373-3429	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
10300 Silverdale Way NW Ste 125	Silverdale	WA	98383-7990	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
7630 N Division St Ste A	Spokane	WA	99208-5614	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 6, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
2921 S 38th St	Tacoma	WA	98409-5605	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
17400 Southcenter Pkwy	Tukwila	WA	98188-3705	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
16601 SE Mill Plain Blvd	Vancouver	WA	98684-8948	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
15521 E Broadway Ave	Veradale	WA	99037-9544	May 8, 2013 - August 11, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 9, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
1729 S 1st St	Yakima	WA	98901-3745	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

### Wisconsin

V ISCONSIN				
695 Main St	Brookfield	WI	53005-4702	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
9090 N Green Bay Rd	Brown Deer	WI	53209-1205	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014
4154 Commonwealth Ave	Eau Claire	WI	54701-9752	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013
N96W 18736 County Line Rd	Germantown	WI	53022-4553	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014
1060 N Port Washington Rd	Grafton	WI	53024-9202	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013

# Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 85 of 108 PageID #:384 AFFECTED U.S. MICHAELS STORES and DATES OF EXPOSURE

4661 Associated Ct	Grand Chute	WI	54913-8217	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013	
				August 13, 2013 - October 6, 2013	
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013	
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014	
1616 W Mason St, Ste B	Green Bay	WI	54303	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	
2900 Deerfield Dr Ste 4	Janesville	WI	53546-3453	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013	
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014	
4271 Lien Rd	Madison	WI	53704-3606	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	
1700 Deming Way Ste 120	Middleton	WI	53562-4757	May 8, 2013 - October 9, 2013	
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014	
3565 S 27th St	Milwaukee	WI	53221-1301	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	
2630 S Green Bay Rd, Ste A	Mount Pleasant	WI	53406-4900	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013	
				August 30, 2013 - October 7, 2013	
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014	
15500 W Beloit Rd	New Berlin	WI	53151-7450	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	
9386 State Rd 16	Onalaska	WI	54650-8526	May 8, 2013 - October 7, 2013	
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014	
1210 Commons Cir	Plover	WI	54467-4129	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013	
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	
				December 11, 2013 - January 18, 2014	
3707 Rib Mountain Dr	Wausau	WI	54401-7492	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	
11135 W National Ave	West Allis	WI	53227-3107	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	

West Virginia

*** OSC					
10 E Mall Rd	Barboursville	WV	25504-1821	May 8, 2013 - August 10, 2013	
				August 13, 2013 - October 8, 2013	
				October 16, 2013 - January 18, 2014	
222 Retail Commons Pkwy	Martinsburg	WV	25403-6177	May 8, 2013 - October 8, 2013	
				October 17, 2013 - November 24, 2013	
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014	
801 Venture Dr	Morgantown	WV	26508-7307	May 8, 2013 - August 12, 2013	
				August 31, 2013 - October 8, 2013	
				October 16, 2013 - November 23, 2013	
				December 12, 2013 - January 19, 2014	
214 RHL Blvd	South Charleston	WV	25309-8262	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	
550 Cabela Dr	Triadelphia	WV	26059-1044	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013	

Wyoming

** young	oming .					
5204 Rue Terre	Cheyenne	WY	82009-5068	May 8, 2013 - July 29, 2013		

Case: 1:14-cv-00561 Document #: 53 Filed: 05/28/14 Page 86 of 108 PageID #:385

# EXHIBIT D

STATE OF ILLINOIS )	S			n —
COUNTY OF LAKE				LEI
	IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF JUDICIAL CIRCUIT, LAKE		MAY	27 2014
VERONICA VIDES, ET AL.,	)		Keiz	L Tri
PLAINTIFFS,	)			2 2 2 3
VS.	)	Case No. 1	3-CH-2701	
ADVOCATE HEALTH AND CORPORATION D/B/A ADV MEDICAL GROUP,	The same and the s			
DEFENDAN	41.			

# Memorandum Opinion and Order

This matter now comes before the Court on the Defendant's combined 735 ILCS 5/2-619(a)(9) and 735 ILCS 5/2-615 motion to dismiss the Complaint filed by Plaintiffs, Veronica Vides, et al. Having heard arguments on the motion, considered the statutory authority and case law, and being fully advised in the premises, the Court now FINDS AS FOLLOWS:

### Background

Advocate Medical Group (hereinafter "Advocate") is an Illinois corporation with its principal place of business in Downers Grove, Illinois. (Compl. ¶22.) Advocate is a network of affiliated doctors and hospitals that systematically and regularly conduct business in and throughout Lake County Illinois. (Compl. ¶23.) Advocate, during the regular course of its business, collected and maintained possession, custody, and control of a wide variety of patient's personal and confidential information, including: Patients' names, addresses, dates of birth, Social Security numbers, treating physician and/or departments for each individual, their medical

diagnoses, medical record numbers, medical service codes, and health insurance information. (Compl. ¶33.) At all relevant times, Plaintiffs were patients of Advocate. (Compl. ¶32.) Advocate stored Plaintiffs' personal, private and confidential data in an unencrypted format on four laptop computers at Advocate's administrative offices in Park Ridge, Illinois. (Compl. ¶34.) On or about July 15, 2013, the four laptop computers containing Plaintiffs' personal and confidential information were removed from Advocates Park Ridge facility during a burglary. (Compl. ¶37.) On August 23, 2013, Advocate sent out letters to affected patients, notifying them of the breach of the security of the system data. (Compl. ¶46.)

As of the current date, Advocate is unaware of the whereabouts of the four laptop computers and their respective hard drives containing the personal, private and confidential patient data. (Compl. ¶38.)

Plaintiffs have filed a Class Action against Defendant, Advocate, alleging six causes of action: (I) Negligence; (II) Violation of Consumer Fraud and Deceptive Business Practices Act; (III) Invasion of Privacy by Public Disclosure of Private Facts; (IV) Consumer Fraud Act; (V) Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress; and (VI) Injunctive Relief. Plaintiffs in this action were:

All persons who were, prior to July 15, 2013, (1) treated at any ADVOCATE facility and/or (2) treated by a physician, physician assistant, nurse, nurse practitioner, technician, laboratory assistant, or any other medical specialist, who was employed by and/or contracted with ADVOCATE to provide treatment and/or care, and who was caused to provide ADVOCATE with personal, private and/or confidential information, including but not limited to names, addresses, dates of birth, social security numbers, health insurance data, medical diagnoses, diagnoses codes, and medical record numbers. (Compl. ¶25.)

Plaintiffs claim they suffered different types of injuries due to the security breach, including: increased risk of identity theft and/or fraud, out-of-pocket expenses incurred to

mitigate the increased risk of identity theft and/or fraud, time lost mitigating the increased risk of identity theft and/or fraud, loss of privacy, and anxiety and emotional distress. (Compl. ¶68.)

Advocate moves to dismiss the Complaint pursuant to 735 ILCS 5/2-619(a)(9) and 735 ILCS 5/2-615, asserting both lack of standing to brings the claims alleged in the Complaint and failure to state a claim upon which relief may be granted.

#### Discussion

# I. Standing

Section 2-619(a)(9) permits involuntary dismissal where "the claim asserted against defendant is barred by other affirmative matter avoiding the legal effect of or defeating the claim." 735 ILCS 5/2-619(a)(9) (West 2014). Lack of standing is an "affirmative matter" that is properly raised under section 2-619(a)(9). See *Greer v. Illinois Housing Development Authority*, 122 Ill.2d 462, 494 (1988) (holding that lack of standing is an "affirmative" defense).

The doctrine of standing is designed to preclude persons who have no interest in a controversy from bringing suit. The doctrine assures that issues are raised only by those parties with a real interest in the outcome of the controversy. Glisson v. City of Marion, 188 Ill.2d 211, 221 (1999). The general principle was set forth in Greer v. Illinois Housing Development Authority. The claimed injury, whether "actual or threatened" must be: (1) "distinct and palpable"; (2) "fairly traceable" to the defendant's actions; and (3) substantially likely to be prevented or redressed by the grant of the requested relief. Id. at 492-93.

#### a. Increased Risk of Future Harm

Plaintiffs argue injury in the form of increased risk of identity theft and/or fraud due to the exposure of their personal information. Plaintiffs have not cited an Illinois decision specifically addressing the issue of standing in this circumstance. However, the Illinois Supreme Court has held that "as a matter of law, an increased risk of future harm is an element of damages that can be recovered for a present injury—it is not the injury itself." Williams v. Manchester, 228 Ill.2d 404, 425 (2008) (emphasis in original). Applying Williams, the federal courts have held that a plaintiff whose personal data had been compromised "may collect damages based on the increased risk of future harm he incurred, but only if he can show that he suffered from some present injury beyond the mere exposure of his information to the public." Rowe v. UniCare Life and Health Ins. Co., No. 09 C 2286, 2010 WL 86391, at \*6 (N.D.Ill. 2010).

A recent decision by the United States Supreme Court appears to have addressed the issue of whether a court can confer standing based on the risk of future harm. In Clapper v. Amnesty Intern'I USA, 133 S.Ct. 1138 (2012), the Supreme Court dismissed for lack of standing a suit brought by attorneys and organizers who alleged that their communications were likely to be monitored under a purportedly unconstitutional federal surveillance statute, given that they worked with persons likely to be targeted for surveillance. As explained in Clapper, "allegations of possible future injury are not sufficient" to establish standing. Id. at 1147. The Court acknowledged that "imminence is concededly a somewhat elastic concept," but reemphasized its statements in prior cases that to confer standing the threatened injury must be "certainly impending." Id. at 1147, 1160. Employing that standard, the Clapper Court held that the threat of government interception of private communications between the plaintiffs and foreign contacts suspected of terrorism was too speculative to confer standing on the plaintiffs to challenge the law authorizing government surveillance of "non-United States persons" because realization of

the harm alleged-the interception of the plaintiffs' communications with such persons-was dependent on a variety of events and actions by independent third parties that might never come to pass. *Id.* at 1148-50.

In the present matter, Clapper compels rejection of Plaintiffs' argument that an increased risk of identity theft is sufficient to satisfy the injury-in-fact requirement for standing. Whether Plaintiffs actually become victims of identity theft as a result of the removal of the computers depends on a number of variables, such as whether their data was actually taken after the removal, whether it was subsequently sold or otherwise transferred, whether anyone who obtained the data attempted to use it, and whether or not they succeeded. Plaintiffs' Complaint provides no basis to believe that any of these events have come to pass or are imminent. Like the plaintiffs in Clapper, the harm that Plaintiffs fear is contingent on a chain of attenuated hypothetical events and actions by third parties independent of the defendant. Id. at 1148. Although Plaintiffs do not need to show that they are "literally certain" they will be victims of identity theft and/or fraud, they have not alleged facts that would plausibly establish an "imminent" or "certainly impending" risk that they will be victimized. Under Clapper, the mere fact that the risk has been increased does not suffice to establish standing.

The Federal Courts of Appeal have examined this issue and this Court finds persuasive the reasoning in the line of cases rejecting risk of harm as an injury-in-fact in the context of data breaches. See, e.g., Reilly v. Ceridian Corp., 664 F.3d 38, 42 (3rd Cir. 2011) (finding plaintiffs lacked standing because harm depended on third parties reading, copying, and understanding their personal information, intending to use such information to commit future criminal acts, and being able to make unauthorized transactions in plaintiffs' names in the future); In re Barnes & Noble Pin Pad Litig., 2013 WL 4759588, at \*3 (N.D.III. 2013) (citing Clapper and stating,

"[m]erely alleging an increased risk of identity theft or fraud is insufficient to establish standing."); Hammond v. The Bank of New York Mellon Corp., 2010 WL 2643307, at \*2 (S.D.N.Y. 2010) ("Plaintiffs here do not have Article III standing (i.e., there is no "case or controversy") because they claim to have suffered little more than an increased risk of future harm from the loss (whether by accident or theft) of their personal information."); Allison v. Aetna, Inc., 2010 WL 3719243, at \*5 (E.D.Pa. 2010) (granting motion to dismiss for lack of standing because the plaintiffs "alleged injury of an increased risk of identity theft is far too speculative."); Amburgy v. Express Scripts, Inc., 671 F.Supp.2d 1046, 1052 (E.D.Mo. 2009) ("[P]laintiff surmises that, as a result of the security breach, he faces an increased risk of identity theft at an unknown point in the future. On the facts as alleged in the Complaint, it cannot be said that the alleged injury to plaintiff is imminent."); Hinton v. Heartland Payment Sys., Inc., 2009 WL 704139, at \*1 (D.N.J. Mar. 16, 2009) (sua sponte dismissing case because plaintiff's allegations of increased risk of identity theft and fraud "amount to nothing more than mere speculation."); Randolph v. ING Life Ins. and Annuity Co., 486 F. Supp.2d 1, 8 (D.D.C.2007) ("Plaintiffs' allegations therefore amount to mere speculation that at some unspecified point in the indefinite future they will be the victims of identity theft."); Key v. DSW, Inc., 454 F. Supp.2d 684, 689 (S.D.Ohio 2006) ("In the identity theft context, courts have embraced the general rule that an alleged increase in risk of future injury is not an 'actual or imminent' injury."); Bell v. Acxiom Corp., 2006 WL 2850042, at \*2 (E.D.Ark. 2006) (rejecting plaintiff's allegation of increased risk of identity theft and stating, "[b]ecause Plaintiff has not alleged that she has suffered any concrete damages, she does not have standing under the case-or-controversy requirement.").

This Court acknowledges the holdings of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Seventh and Ninth Circuits finding that the mere increased risk of theft or fraud is sufficiently concrete injury-in-fact to confer standing. See *Pisciotta v. Old Nat'l Bancorp*, 499 F.3d 629 (7<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2007); *Krottner v. Starbucks Corp.*, 628 F.3d 1139 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2010). However, those cases were decided prior to *Clapper*. The *Pisciotta* court held "a threat of future harm or . . . an act which harms the plaintiff only by increasing the risk of future harm that the plaintiff would have otherwise faced, absent the defendant's actions" is sufficient to find standing. *Pisciotta*, 499 F.3d at 634. However, this holding did not discuss or address the requirement that a threat of harm be "imminent" or "certainly impending". Further, the "not merely speculative" standard for injury-in-fact, set forth by *Krottner*, does not stand up to the reasoning and holding in *Clapper*. More is required under *Clapper* to show that an injury is certainly impending.

The Court therefore finds that the increased risk that Plaintiffs will be victims of identity theft and/or identity fraud at some indeterminate point in the future does not constitute injury sufficient to confer standing. The occurrence of such future injury rests on the criminal actions of independent decision makers and the Plaintiffs' Complaint lacks sufficient factual allegations to show such future injury is imminent or certainly impending.

### b. Statutory violations

Plaintiffs have alleged Defendants violated the Personal Information Protection Act (hereinafter "PIPA") by waiting six weeks to notify Plaintiffs' of the removal of the computers containing their personal information instead of notifying them "immediately following discovery" or notifying them "in the most expedient time possible and without unreasonable delay." 815 ILCS 530/10(a) (West 2014); (Compl. ¶60, 61.) A violation of PIPA constitutes an

unlawful practice under the Consumer Fraud and deceptive Business Practices Act (hereinafter "ICFA"). 815 ILCS 530/20 (West 2014).

Additionally, Plaintiffs allege Defendants violated the ICFA by making Plaintiffs' social security numbers available to the public when the four computers were removed from Defendant's administrative building. (Compl. ¶72.) The violations of these Acts, argue Plaintiffs, constitute actual injury sufficient to convey standing.

However, this argument is misplaced. Even assuming the statutes have been violated by the delay or inadequacy of Defendant's notification, breach of these statutes is insufficient to establish standing without any actual damages due to the breach. People ex rel. Madigan v. United Const. of Am., Inc., 2012 IL App 120308, ¶15 (1st Dist. 2013). The ICFA provision cited by the Plaintiffs in their Supplemental Brief stipulates there must be damage beyond the mere violation of the statute. 815 ILCS 505/10a(c) (West 2014) (relief is granted to "[a]ny person who suffers actual damage as a result of a violation of this Act."). Accordingly, the purported untimely or inadequate notification of the security breach by Defendants is insufficient to establish Plaintiffs suffered actual injury for purposes of Article III standing. In re Barnes & Noble Pin Pad Litig., 2013 WL 4759588 (N.D. III. 2013).

Thus, statutory violations by themselves are insufficient to establish standing. The Plaintiffs' Complaint must include allegations that they have been damaged by the violations to establish standing. Strautins v. Trustwave Holdings, Inc., 12 C 09115, 2014 WL 960816 (N.D. Ill. 2014); see also FMC Corp. v. Boesky, 852 F.2d 981, 998 (7th Cir.1988). The complaint fails to do so.

# c. Time and Expenses Incurred to Mitigate Risks of Identity Theft

Plaintiffs contend they suffered injury by incurring time and expenses for creditor monitoring and incurring costs to mitigate the increased risk of identity theft and/or identity fraud. The Complaint states the Plaintiffs "suffered and will continue to suffer ... out-of-pocket expenses incurred to mitigate the increased risk of identity theft and/or identity fraud. . . the value of their time spent mitigating actual or the increased risk of identity theft and/or identity fraud...." (Compl. ¶68.) This Court disagrees.

Such injury does not suffice to confer standing because Plaintiffs "cannot manufacture standing merely by inflicting harm on themselves based on their fears of hypothetical future harm that is not certainly impending." Clapper, 133 S.Ct. at 1143, 1151 (rejecting respondents' alternative argument that they were suffering "present injury because the risk of ... surveillance already has forced them to take costly and burdensome measures to protect the confidentiality of their international communications."). "[A]llowing [Plaintiffs] to bring this action based on costs they incurred in response to a speculative threat would be tantamount to accepting a repackaged version of [Plaintiffs'] first failed theory of standing." Id. (citing Am. Civil Liberties Union v. Nat'l Sec. Agency, 493 F.3d 655, 656-57 (6th Cir.2007)).

Lower federal courts have rejected Plaintiffs' argument in the data breach context as well. See, e.g., Reilly, 664 F.3d at 46 ("costs incurred to watch for a speculative chain of future events based on hypothetical future criminal acts are no more 'actual' injuries than the alleged 'increased risk of injury' which forms the basis for Appellants' claims."); Brit Ins. Holdings N.V. v. Krantz, 2012 WL 28342, at \*9 (N.D.Ohio 2012) ("defendants' expenditure of resources to investigate the ramifications of plaintiffs' disclosure, and to purchase personal credit and identity protection services to protect against future harm, are insufficient to demonstrate that defendants

suffered an actual injury-in-fact."); Giordano v. Wachovia Sec., LLC, 2006 WL 2177036, at \*4 (D.N.J. 2006) ("Plaintiffs allegations that ... she will incur costs associated with obtaining credit monitoring services in order to prevent identity theft simply does not rise to the level of creating a concrete and particularized injury.").

#### d. Anxiety and Emotional Distress

For the same reasons as stated in the above section, Plaintiffs' claim of injury in the form of anxiety and emotional distress is insufficient to establish standing. Any anxiety or emotional distress suffered by Plaintiffs' is not based on an imminent threat, but future criminal acts that are only speculative. As noted above, the anxiety or distress incurred "in response to a speculative threat would be tantamount to accepting a repackaged version of [Plaintiffs'] first failed theory of standing." Clapper, 133 S.Ct. at 1143, 1151.

The U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit and at least one lower federal court have addressed emotional distress as an injury in fact in the context of a data breach. See Reilly v. Ceridian Corp., 664 F.3d 38, 42-43 (3d Cir.2011) (Emotional distress in the wake of a security breach is insufficient to establish standing, particularly in a case that does not involve an imminent threat to the information); In re Barnes & Noble Pin Pad Litig., 2013 WL 4759588 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 3, 2013) ("[Plaintiff's] anxiety following the security breach is insufficient to establish standing, as there is no indication there is an imminent threat of her information being used in a malicious way. . . .").

Thus, this Court finds no standing conferred based on anxiety or emotional distress suffered by Plaintiffs.

# e. Loss of Privacy

Injury in the form of loss of privacy is insufficient to establish standing in this case.

Necessary to a claim of loss of privacy is the disclosure of personal information. However, Plaintiffs have not pled any facts to support the allegations that the information was disclosed. It appears Plaintiffs seek to establish that their information was disclosed because computers were removed from Defendant's administrative offices. The inference that the data on the computers was disclosed, based on the computers themselves being removed from the offices, is too tenuous to support a reasonable inference that can be made in Plaintiffs' favor. Without the inference that Plaintiffs' information was disclosed at all, there is only speculation that Plaintiffs have suffered the injury of loss of privacy in this matter.

In sum, Plaintiffs' Complaint does not sufficiently allege that the injury of identity theft and/or identity fraud is certainly impending. Therefore, the increased risk of such injury does not suffice to confer standing. Additionally, Plaintiffs cannot create standing by choosing to make expenditures in order to mitigate a purely speculative harm or by alleging anxiety and emotional distress based on the speculative harm. Further, the allegations in the complaint do not support the conclusion that any information has been disclosed. Therefore, there can be no actual injury for loss of privacy, which requires disclosure of information. Accordingly, none of Plaintiffs' claimed injuries constitute an injury-in-fact sufficient to confer standing for Plaintiffs' negligence, violation of PIPA, violation of ICFA, invasion of privacy, and intentional infliction of emotional distress claims.

# II. Failure to State a Claim

In the alternative, Defendant argues that if Plaintiffs' assertions of various injuries are sufficient to confer standing to bring the instant causes of action, the Complaint should nevertheless be dismissed under 735 ILCS 2-615 for failure to state a claim.

A section 2-615 motion does not raise affirmative factual defenses, but attacks the legal sufficiency of a complaint by alleging only defects on the face of the complaint. Bryson v. News America Publications, Inc., 174 Ill.2d 77, 86 (1996). A court must determine whether the allegations of the complaint, when viewed in a light most favorable to the plaintiff, are sufficient to state a cause of action upon which relief can be granted. Id.; Urbaitis v. Commonwealth Edison, 143 Ill.2d 458, 475 (1991). "A cause of action should not be dismissed on the pleadings unless it clearly appears that no set of facts can be proved under the pleadings which will entitle the plaintiff to recover." Id.; Gouge v. Central Illinois Public Service Co., 144 Ill.2d 535, 542 (1991).

Moreover, Illinois is a fact-pleading jurisdiction. A plaintiff must allege facts sufficient to bring his or her claim within the scope of the cause of action asserted. Anderson v. Vanden Dorpel, 172 Ill.2d 399, 408 (1996); People ex rel. Fahner v. Carriage Way West, Inc., 88 Ill.2d 300, 308 (1981). When reviewing a motion to dismiss under 735 ILCS 2-615, "a court must disregard the conclusions that are pleaded and look only to well-pleaded facts to determine whether they are sufficient to state a cause of action against the defendant." City of Chicago v. Beretta U.S.A Corp., 213 Ill. 2d 351, 368 (2004).

Against this backdrop, the Court turns to each of Plaintiffs' claims to determine whether they state a claim upon which relief can be granted.

# a. Negligence

In Count I of the Complaint, Plaintiffs allege the following: (1) Defendant had a duty to securely maintain, and not disseminate Plaintiffs' personal, private and confidential health information; (2) On or about July 15, 2013, Defendant wrongfully permitted the unauthorized and unlawful disclosure of Plaintiffs' personal, private and confidential information; and (3) As a result of Defendant's acts and omissions, Plaintiffs suffered personal and pecuniary damages. (Compl. ¶49, ¶54, ¶55.)

To succeed on their negligence claims, plaintiffs must allege and prove that (1) defendants owed a duty to plaintiffs; (2) defendants breached that duty; and (3) the breach caused injury to plaintiffs. Cooney v. Chicago Public Schools, 407 Ill. App.3d 358, 361 (1st Dist. 2010). Defendant argues that Plaintiffs' allegations fail to state a claim for relief inasmuch as Plaintiff fails to allege a compensable injury resulting in damage. This Court agrees.

Plaintiffs argue that they have suffered a present injury and damage in the loss and disclosure of their personal data and confidential medical information, from which future damages can flow. (Pl. Brief in Resp., Pg. 9) However, even Plaintiffs' argument acknowledges that they have not suffered actual damages such as the loss of property or money but rather, if anything, alleges only that they are subject to an increased risk of identity theft and they might now have to pay for credit monitoring.

In the somewhat analogous context of toxic tort liability, Illinois courts have suggested that compensable damage requires more than an exposure to a future potential harm. See Betts v. Manville Personal Injury Settlement Trust, 225 Ill.App.3d 882, 898 (4<sup>th</sup> Dist. 1992); Morrissy v. Eli Lilly & Co., 76 Ill.App.3d 753, 761 (1<sup>st</sup> Dist. 1979). Indeed, the Illinois Supreme Court in Williams v. Manchester, 228 Ill. 2d 404 (2008), held a plaintiff must show "a present, actionable

injury" resulting from radiation exposure. Specifically, the Williams court stated, "[A]s a matter of law, an increased risk of future harm is an element of damages that can be recovered for a present injury – it is not the injury itself." Id. at 425.

In federal court, the Seventh Circuit conducted such an examination to determine whether Indiana negligence law supported allegations similar to the Plaintiffs' against a bank whose website was breached by a hacker. *Pisciotta v. Old Nat'l Bancorp.* 499 F.3d 629 (7th Cir., 2007). After finding that no Indiana case established that credit monitoring costs constituted present injury, the court found that analogous cases from other jurisdictions all "rel[ied] on the same basic premise: Without more than allegations of increased risk of future identity theft, the plaintiffs have not suffered a harm that the law is prepared to remedy." *Id.* at 639.

Like the Seventh Circuit in Pisciotta, numerous federal courts applying state law have come to the same conclusion. See, e.g., Krottner v. Starbucks Corp., 406 Fed.Appx. 129, 131-32 (9th Cir.2010); Amburgy v. Express Scripts, Inc., 671 F.Supp.2d 1046, 1054-55 (E.D.Mo.2009); Belle Chasse Auto. Care, Inc. v. Advanced Auto Parts, Inc., 2009 WL 799760, at \*3 (E.D.La. Mar. 24, 2009); Caudle v. Towers, Perrin, Forster & Crosby, Inc., 580 F.Supp.2d 273, 281-82 (S.D.N.Y.2008); Hendricks v. DSW Shoe Warehouse, Inc., 444 F.Supp.2d 775, 783 (W.D.Mich.2006); Forbes v. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A., 420 F.Supp.2d 1018, 1020-21 (D.Minn.2006). In so holding, courts have sometimes noted that plaintiffs asserting these claims "have pointed to no case decided anywhere in the country where a court allowed a negligence claim to survive absent an allegation of actual identity theft." McLoughlin v. People's United Bank, Inc., 2009 WL 2843269, at \*8 (D.Conn. 2009); see also Hammond v. Bank of New York Mellon Corp., 2010 WL 2643307, at \*1 (S.D.N.Y. 2010) (collecting cases).

Many other decisions have echoed this reasoning. The Oregon Supreme Court held that allegations that did not include "actual identity theft or financial harm, other than credit monitoring and similar mitigation costs" did not allege sufficient "present injury" under the state's "well-established negligence requirements." Paul v. Providence Health System-Oregon, 351 Or. 587, 597 (2012) (internal quotation marks and citation omitted). The District of Columbia Court of Appeals has ruled similarly, citing a significant number of analogous decisions from other jurisdictions. Randolph v. ING Life Ins. and Annuity Co., 973 A.2d 702, 708 (D.C.2009) (collecting cases). In particular, the court cited Shafran v. Harley-Davidson, Inc., 2008 WL 763177, at \*3 (S.D.N.Y. 2008), in which it was noted that "[c]ourts have uniformly ruled that the time and expense of credit monitoring to combat an increased risk of future identity theft is not, in itself, an injury that the law [of negligence] is prepared to remedy."

This Court holds that nothing in Plaintiffs' Complaint alleges actual injury or damages. Failure to state sufficient facts to constitute a legally cognizable present injury or damage mandates dismissal of the action. *Verb v. Motorola, Inc.*, 284 Ill.App.3d 460, 471 (1<sup>st</sup> Dist. 1996). As plaintiff's claims of negligence require actual injury or damage, this Court holds Plaintiffs' negligence claim is dismissed.

### b. Consumer Fraud Act

Plaintiffs have alleged Defendants violated the Personal Information Protection Act and the Illinois Consumer Fraud Act and claim they have or will incur economic damages as a result of the Defendant's acts. (Compl. ¶73.)

As set forth in Cooney v. Chicago Public Schools, 407 Ill.App.3d 358 (1st Dist. 2010), Plaintiffs must allege actual damages to bring a Consumer Fraud Act action. See 815 ILCS 505/10a(a) (West 2014) ("[a]ny person who suffers actual damage as a result of a violation of

this Act committed by any other person may bring an action against such person"); Morris v. Harvey Cycle & Camper. Inc., 392 Ill.App.3d 399, 402 (1st Dist. 2009) ("[t]he failure to allege specific, actual damages precludes a claim brought under the Consumer Fraud Act"). To support a Consumer Fraud Act claim, actual damages must arise from "purely economic injuries." Morris, 392 Ill.App.3d at 402.

Plaintiffs attempt to distinguish the Cooney case from the present matter, but fail because the court in Cooney directly addressed whether an increased risk of future identity theft can serve as actual damages to support a Consumer Fraud Act claim. The court in Cooney concluded the following:

In Yu v. International Business Machines Corp., 314 Ill.App.3d 892, 247 Ill.Dec. 841, 732 N.E.2d 1173 (2000), we held that allegations of potential harm arising from a software defect were insufficient to support a Consumer Fraud Act claim, justifying a section 2-615 dismissal. Without actual injury or damage, the plaintiff's claims "constitute[d] conjecture and speculation." Yu, 314 Ill, App. 3d at 897, 247 Ill, Dec. 841, 732 N.E. 2d 1173. See also Williams v. Manchester, 228 III.2d 404, 425, 320 III.Dec. 784, 888 N.E.2d 1 (2008) ("as a matter of law, an increased risk of future harm is an element of damages that can be recovered for a present injury-it is not the injury itself") (emphasis in original); Pisciotta v. Old National Bancorp, 499 F.3d 629, 639 (7th Cir.2007) ("[w]ithout more than allegations of increased risk of future identity theft, the plaintiffs have not suffered a harm that the law is prepared to remedy"); Morris, 392 Ill.App.3d at 403, 331 Ill.Dec. 819, 911 N.E.2d 1049, citing Xydakis v. Target, Inc., 333 F.Supp.2d 686, 688 (N.D.Ill.2004) ("[t]here is no cause of action under the Consumer Fraud Act when a plaintiff alleges only aggravation and not actual damages").

Cooney v. Chicago Public Schools, 407 Ill. App. 3d at 366,

Plaintiffs' argument that damages under the ICFA can be presumed from the language of the ICFA is wholly misplaced. Plaintiffs cite no authority for this proposition other than quoting the language of 815 ILCS 505/10a(a) stating, "The court, in its discretion may award actual

economic damages or any other relief." However, the Plaintiff fails to recognize the significance of the first sentence of section 10a(a) which requires a person to suffer actual damage before bringing a cause of action. First, actual damages must be present, and then a court may award economic damages or other relief. Further, this Court is bound by decisions of the Second District appellate court holding, "damages may not be presumed under the Consumer Fraud Act." Duran v. Leslie Oldsmobile, Inc., 229 Ill. App.3d 1032, 1041 (2nd Dist. 1992); See Avery v. State Farm Mutual Ins. Co., 216 Ill.2d 100, 196 (2005) ("The language of the Consumer Fraud Act is plain. A plaintiff must prove 'actual damage' before he or she can recover under the Act.").

The Cooney case also held that the purchase of credit monitoring services cannot establish actual damages to support an ICFA claim, citing federal authority. Cooney v. Chicago Public Schools, 407 Ill. App at 366; See Rowe v. UniCare Life & Health Insurance Co., 2010 WL 86391 (N.D.Ill. 2010) (finding the provision of credit monitoring services by the defendants "does not resolve the question of whether credit monitoring costs are actual damages" and finding that "the costs of credit monitoring services are not a present harm in and of themselves"); Aliano v. Texas Roadhouse Holdings LLC, 2008 WL 5397510 (N.D.Ill. 2008) (finding that the purchase of credit monitoring services does not constitute actual damages and citing district courts in Michigan, Minnesota, Ohio and New York in agreement); see also Harris v. Wal-Mart Stores Inc., 2008 WL 5085132 (N.D.Ill. 2008) (rejecting claim for damages under the Credit and Debit Card Receipt Clarification Act of 2007, Pub.L. No. 110-241, 122 Stat. 1565 (2008) (codified at 15 U.S.C. § 1681) for the cost of credit monitoring services).

Thus, Counts II and IV of Plaintiffs' Compaint alleging violations of PIPA and ICFA are not viable causes of action. Plaintiffs' have not alleged actual damages arising from violations of the statutes and cannot rely on speculative future damages or presumed damages to support their claims.

# c. Invasion of Privacy By Public Disclosure of Private Facts

To state a cause of action for this tort, the plaintiff must plead and prove that (1) publicity was given to the disclosure of private facts; (2) the facts were private, and not public, facts; and (3) the matter made public was such as to be highly offensive to a reasonable person. Miller v. Motorola, Inc., 202 III.App.3d 976, 978 (1st Dist. 1990).

First, there is no allegation in the Complaint that Defendant disclosed Plaintiffs' private information. While the Complaint alleges Defendant permitted the unauthorized and unlawful disclosure and dissemination of Plaintiffs' personal, private and confidential information, that allegation is conclusory. There are no factual allegations in the Complaint to make plausible the assertion that Defendant disclosed and disseminated Plaintiffs' private information. Rather, the Complaint alleges the computers containing the private information were removed from Defendant's administrative offices, not that Defendant disseminated it to anyone.

Second, even if the Complaint sufficiently alleged dissemination, the Complaint fails to allege publicity. The tort of invasion of privacy by publication of private facts includes as an element publicity to the public at large or to so many persons that the information is certain to become public knowledge. See, e.g., Restatement (second) of Torts § 652D, comment a. Illinois courts have adopted a modification of the Restatement's definition of "public" as those with whom the plaintiff has a special relationship, making even the relatively limited disclosure particularly embarrassing or devastating to the plaintiff. *Miller v. Motorola, Inc.*, 202 Ill.App.3d at 976-977.

Using either definition of "public", Plaintiff fails to allege publicity. The Complaint makes no allegations about what happened to the data on the computers once they were removed from the administrative offices. The Complaint only alleges that the "private and confidential information could have been bought and sold several times on the robust international cyber black market." (Compl ¶47.) The Complaint alleges no facts as to how many persons ever had the personal information and whether the persons sold the personal information to anyone, let alone whether the persons even were able to access the personal information from the computers removed. Therefore, the allegation that the removal of the computers "resulted in the public disclosure of such private information" is conclusory in that Plaintiffs allege no facts to make plausible the assertion that Plaintiffs' personal information was publicly disclosed. Without an allegation that the personal information here was disclosed to and viewed by someone unauthorized to do so, Plaintiffs have failed to state a claim for invasion of privacy.

# d. Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress

To state a cause of action for intentional infliction of emotional distress, a plaintiff must allege certain facts. First, the defendant's conduct must be truly extreme and outrageous. *McGrath v. Fahey*, 126 Ill.2d 78, 86 (1988). Second, the defendant either *intended* to inflict severe emotional distress, or knew that there was at least a high probability that the conduct would cause severe emotional distress. *Id.* Third, the defendant's conduct actually caused *severe* emotional distress. *Id.* In its motion to dismiss, Defendant asserts that the facts alleged in the Plaintiffs' complaint are insufficient to satisfy the first and third elements of the tort. This court agrees.

Similar to the reasoning in Welsh v. Commonwealth Edison Co., 306 Ill. App.3d 148 (1st Dist. 1999), this Court holds that Plaintiff's fail to allege facts from which a level of severity of

emotional distress could be inferred. Instead, Plaintiffs simply set forth a conclusory allegation: "Defendant, ADVOCATE, knew or should have known that Defendant's unauthorized dissemination of Plaintiffs' and Class Members' personal, private and confidential information would inflict upon Plaintiffs' and Class Members' severe emotional distress, which did in fact cause emotional distress to Plaintiffs." (Compl. ¶80.) This statement in the Complaint does not support a conclusion that the emotional distress suffered was severe. "Merely characterizing emotional distress as severe is not sufficient." Welsh, 306 Ill.App.3d at 156.

Plaintiffs' respond to Defendant's argument by stating that the severity of the emotional distress meets the requisite level. (Pl. Brief in Resp., pg. 15.) However, no facts are forthcoming from the Plaintiffs to support such a statement. To state an action for intentional infliction of emotional distress, the complaint must be "specific, and detailed beyond what is normally considered permissible in pleading a tort action." McCaskill v. Barr, 92 Ill.App.3d 157, 158 (4th Dist. 1980). No allegations of hospital care or medical care sought are made by Plaintiffs. Welsh, 306 Ill.App.3d at 155. Nor are allegations made that any Plaintiffs were "afflicted with a physical or mental condition rendering him or her particularly vulnerable to emotional distress." Id. Plaintiffs' failure to sufficiently allege the degree of emotional distress requires dismissal of the cause of action.

### III. Economic Loss doctrine

Defendant's Motion to Dismiss also asserts the economic loss doctrine as a basis to dismiss Plaintiff's tort claims pursuant to 735 ILCS 5/2-615. The economic loss doctrine bars recovery in tort actions solely for economic losses. *In re III. Bell Switching Station Litig.*, 161 Ill.2d 233 (1994). The rationale underlying this doctrine is that tort law affords the proper remedy for loss arising from personal injury or damages to one's property, whereas contract law

and the Uniform Commercial Code provide the appropriate remedy for economic loss stemming from diminished commercial expectations without related injury to person or property. *Id.* 

There are three exceptions to the economic loss doctrine. The first is where the plaintiff sustained personal injury or property damage resulting from a sudden or dangerous occurrence. Moorman Mfg. Co. v. Nat'l Tank Co., 91 Ill.2d 69, 86-89 (1982). Next is where the plaintiff's damages are proximately caused by a defendant's intentional, false representation. Id. Finally, an exception lies where the plaintiff's damages are proximately caused by a negligent misrepresentation by a defendant in the business of supplying information for the guidance of others in their business transactions. Id. Plaintiffs provided no response to Defendant's argument regarding the economic loss doctrine. Certainly, it appears that none of the three exceptions apply to the Plaintiffs' case. Most of Plaintiffs' alleged injuries are economic losses, with the exception of emotional distress. However, as discussed above, this court does not find emotional distress to be a viable injury when it is based on a purely speculative harm.

Notably, other courts dealing with data breach cases have held that the economic loss doctrine bars the plaintiff's tort claim because the plaintiff has not suffered personal injury or property damage. See, e.g., In re TJX Cos. Retail Sec. Breach Litig., 564 F.3d 489, 498–99 (1st Cir. 2009) (applying Massachusetts law and affirming dismissal of bank's negligence claim based on economic loss doctrine because bank did not suffer property damage); see also Sovereign Bank v. BJ's Wholesale Club, Inc., 533 F.3d 162, 175–77 (3d Cir.2008) (applying Pennsylvania law and affirming dismissal of bank's negligence claim based on economic loss doctrine because bank did not suffer property damage); see also Cumis Ins. Society, Inc. v. BJ's Wholesale Club, Inc., 918 N.E.2d 36, 46–47 (2009) (applying Massachusetts law and affirming

dismissal of negligence claim of credit unions who issued the compromised credit cards because the credit unions cannot sue in tort for purely economic losses).

This Court finds persuasive the reasoning of the courts cited above. Given the nature of the injuries Plaintiffs' have claimed, the economic loss doctrine operates to bar the Plaintiffs' tort claims.

#### Conclusion

Plaintiffs' claimed injuries are insufficient to establish standing. Additionally, the Plaintiffs' causes of action in their Complaint fail to state claims upon which relief can be granted. Further, Plaintiffs cannot sustain their tort claims due to the economic loss doctrine.

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED:

Defendant's combined Motion to Dismiss pursuant to 735 ILCS 5/2-619(a)(9) and 735 ILCS 5/2-615 is granted and Plaintiffs' Complaint is dismissed with prejudice.

DATE: May 27, 2014

Mitchell L. Hoffman

Mitchell L. Hoffman, Circuit Judge